# A TRANSLATION AUTOPSY OF CORMAC McCarthy's *the sunset limited* in spanish: Literary and film coda

#### **Michael Scott Doyle**

[T]he translation is not the work, but a path toward the work.

—José Ortega y Gasset, "The Misery and Splendor of Translation," 109

We now have the personal word of the author's to be transformed into a personal word of the translator's. As always with translation, this calls for a choice among synonyms.

—Gregory Rabassa, If This Be Treason: Translation and Its Dyscontents, 12–13

#### Glossary of the Codes Used

 $S^1 =$  the first Spanish TLT version to be analyzed =  $Y^1$ , the literary translation-in-progress

 $S^2$  = the second Spanish TLT version to be analyzed =  $Y^2$ , the final, published *literary* translation

 $S^3$  = the third Spanish TLT version to be analyzed = the movie subtitles

 $S^4$  = the fourth Spanish TLT version to be analyzed = the movie dubbing

SLT-E = Source Language Text English (Translation from English)

SLT-X = Source Language Text in X Language (Translation from Language X)

TLT = Target Language Text

TLT-S = Target Language Text Spanish (translation into Spanish)

Y<sup>1</sup> = Biopsy Stage of a Translation = the Translation-in-Progress (in the Process of Being Translated)

 $Y^2$  = Autopsy Stage of a Translation = the Final Published Translation (Post-process of the Act of Translating, an Outcome of  $Y^1$ )

#### **Introduction: From Biopsy to Autopsy**

The literary translation criticism undertaken in the *Sendebar* article "A Translation Biopsy of Cormac McCarthy's *The Sunset Limited* in Spanish: Shadowing the Re-creative Process" anticipates a postmortem coda on publication of Luis Murillo Fort's finally static rendition of the "novel in dramatic form." The purpose of the biopsy was to "provide insights into an accomplished translator's thought processes and solutions while in the very moment of translating a challenging genre-blended work of fiction by an American literary icon." It employed a "shadowing methodology as a unique and intimate diagnostic tool for exploring illustrative translation



challenges" in order to follow from within<sup>3</sup> the transformative translatorial process "of creating difference in sameness while maintaining sameness in difference." A purpose of this follow-up autopsy<sup>5</sup> is to revisit those "illustrative translation challenges" to bring closure, via comparison to the final form of Murillo Fort's published translation, to the hesitancy and instability of his translation-in-flux. This article traces translation's peculiar sameness/difference movement from source-language text (SLT) X to target-language texts (TLTs) Y<sup>1</sup> and Y<sup>2</sup>; that is, initially into Y<sup>1</sup> (Biopsy: Translation-in-Progress) and then from Y<sup>1</sup> to Y<sup>2</sup> (Autopsy: Final Published Translation). A literary translation criticism autopsy presupposes its own bioptic stage deliberations, whether addressed separately and formally, as in the present case, or folded into the postmortem itself, which is what generally occurs. The biopsy, TLT-Y<sup>1</sup>, focused on a literary translation process; this autopsy, TLT-Y<sup>2</sup>, focuses on the published literary product that emerged from Y<sup>1</sup>.

The coverage of this translation autopsy coda will also be extended to include two other published forms given to McCarthy's play, such that we can better understand contrastively what became of The Sunset Limited when it was moved from the author's highly stylized, dialectal American English into the distinctive Spanish idio-socio-regionalects of (1) the literary translation proper (Murillo Fort's urban Peninsular Spanish from Barcelona), (2) the HBO film subtitles (a hybrid or filmic-generic Latin American Spanish, as listed in the movie credits, with no identification of the actual translator), and (3) the dubbing of the HBO film (also a no-man's-land generic kind of Latin American Spanish,<sup>6</sup> with no specific identification of the actual dubbing script translator). Our understanding of translation's characteristic sameness-in-difference/differencein-sameness is further developed, then, as SLT-E (E = English) is moved via three different modes and genre functionalities of translation and three different translators into TLT-S (S = the Spanishlanguage) as S<sup>1-4</sup>, all four versions of which lay claim to and trace their identities (a qualified sameness) from SLT-E, McCarthy's American English original. This autopsy invites translators, translation studies scholars, and instructors and students of translation to reflect on methodological and genre-influenced aspects of literary translation and to imagine their own solutions, regardless of SLT and TLT languages, to the translation challenges presented in McCarthy's The Sunset Limited. It is an invitation for them to indulge vicariously, via the examples analyzed, in their own process-to-product considerations, weighing their own eventual "choice among synonyms."<sup>7</sup>

We begin with a summary of the English- and Spanish-language chronologies of *The Sunset Limited*.

## The Early Life of McCarthy's *The Sunset Limited* in English and Spanish: Play Script, Novel, Movie Script, Literary Translation

The initial English-language chronology of McCarthy's *The Sunset Limited* starts with the world premiere of the play, directed by Sheldon Patinkin and featuring Freeman Coffey (as protagonist Black) and Austin Pendleton (as antagonist White), which was presented by Steppenwolf Theatre Company of Chicago from May 18 to June 25, 2006. The play script was subsequently published by Vintage International Edition in October 2006, "verbatim except for the addition of a cryptic subtitle, *A Novel in Dramatic Form*, with which it distinguishes itself from the stage play by making an issue of its own novelistic capacity for prosaic meditation." The HBO movie, "Written by Cormac McCarthy" and "Based on the Play Written by Cormac McCarthy" (doubly credited as such in the film), directed by Tommy Lee Jones, and starring Samuel L. Jackson (as Black) and Tommy Lee Jones (as White), was released in the United States on February 12, 2011.

May 18–June	Cormac McCarthy's The Sunset Limited is first used
25, 2006	(published) as a play script for the Steppenwolf Theatre
	Company performance.
October 2006	Vintage International Edition published the play script with
	the subtitle of A Novel in Dramatic Form.
February 12,	HBO released a movie adaptation of The Sunset Limited.
2011	The HBO movie includes subtitles and dubbing in Spanish
	(concurrent with movie release).
February 2012	Random House Mondadori (Barcelona) published a literary
	translation into Spanish.

CHART 1
Initial English–Spanish bilingual life of *The Sunset Limited* 

As re-Englished by McCarthy himself, the movie script includes numerous abridgments that he felt were most congruent for the cinematic adaptation of his own novel and play. The translation characteristic of sameness/difference permeates the various semiotic and genre-driven functional modes—the SLT is a play on the stage, a book (both a novel and a play), a script (both a play and a movie), and a movie—as well as being visually apparent in the different actors who interpret the same characters: Coffey and Jackson both play the role of Black, as Pendleton and Jones do for White. The chronological life of *The Sunset Limited* in Spanish—still the same literary work (more or less, more and less) despite becoming different because of the Spanishes in which it now occurs<sup>11</sup>—begins with the cinematic subtitle and dubbing of the HBO film's U.S. release in February 2011, followed by Luis Murillo Fort's literary translation in February 2012. A chronological summary is provided in Chart 1.

#### **Autopsy of the Literary Translation: Methodology**

The illustrative literary translation challenges to be revisited for process-to-product and intersemiotic closure are: the title, names of characters, untranslatable diction and dialect, agreement and skeptical irony of "mm hm" and "mm" interjections, and slang/informal speech—"chippied," "honey," "ball park," "busted out," "the dozens," "third railers," and "trick bag," along with several other representative examples. Since this autopsy coda issues from the preceding biopsy, which provided detailed translation process analyses not to be repeated, a complementary reading (from process/hesitancy to closure/published product) might best be recommended in tandem.

This article's literary translation criticism methodology—a new, contrastive reading of the movement of SLT-E to Y<sup>1-2</sup> and S<sup>1-4</sup>: the Spanish TLTs of the (1) literary translation-in-progress (Y<sup>1</sup>, bioptic stage; also S<sup>1</sup>); (2) final, published literary translation (Y<sup>2</sup>, autopsy stage; also S<sup>2</sup>); (3) subtitles (S<sup>3</sup>); and (4) dubbing (S<sup>4</sup>)—aims to show how the sameness (always a qualified equivalence) of SLT-E prevails in a relative manner (the ecology of literary translation as inexactitude  $\approx^{12}$ ) in four different renditions (and three translator idiosociolects) into the diverse Spanish dialects of Spain (Barcelona) and a generic, hybrid, HBO Latin American Spanish. Heuristic back-translation (BT) from Spanish into a more strictly literal and a less literal (straightforward, meaning-based, communicative) English, rather than a stylized and polished literary BT, will allow readers to follow more clearly the SLT movements into different yet generally acceptable renditions of X  $\approx$ 

 $Y^{1-2} \approx S^{1-4}$ . In contrast with its more traditional service as a measure of translation equivalence qua exactitude—which is nostalgic in nature, a wistful looking back at the SLT—here BT is intended to serve more as a measure of inexactitude, revealing its reach and forms, how and how much (degree and intensity), and when and how the inexactitude of the TLT is arguably too little or too much. In relation to the SLT, the back-translated TLT now becomes both inward and forward looking; that is, both process- and product-oriented.<sup>14</sup> BT now serves another purpose beyond that of a sentimental longing to return home to or mourn the diminishment or absence of the SLT, as it is no longer loss that is being measured as much as it is the emergence and extent of new form and manner via the TLT, which lives and breathes on its own merits. BT's heuristic narrative is concerned with more than the traditional issue of where a literary translation came from—Ortega y Gasset's "path [back] toward the work." It is also a springboard away from and beyond that work into the story of what became of an SLT—what it became, how it became the TLT that it did, and why (in this case, due partially to the conventions of different genres)—as a result of that transformative becoming-something-else process that is translation. BT should help clarify how, why, and to what extent a literary translation becomes a different text in its own right—linguistically and culturally. It is a useful heuristic in our consideration of literary translation as an aesthetic, ecology, and celebration of inexactitude, which itself should be considered as a comfort rather than a discomfort zone of literary translation. The inexactitude of translated literature, in which synonymic texts are always inexact equivalencies and substitutions, is where languages showcase their uniqueness and incompatibilities within translation's sameness/difference paradigm. In literary translation, this art of inexactitude is the art of the near miss. Literary translation celebrates the near miss that characterizes the difference within cross-linguistic synonymity that paradoxically constitutes getting it just right in translation. This celebration of the near miss as getting it just right is a fundamental difference between literary and nonliterary translation. It is the difference between getting it right literally (in nonliterary translation such as legal, business, or medical discourse) and getting it right literarily (in terms of considerations such as sound, rhythm, manner, and metaphor), two distinct translation purposes, methods, and outcomes. BT shows how and where the near miss occurs in literary translation.

The artful work of translating literature takes place in the gaps—the spaces of the potential realization of imperfect sameness ( $\approx$ )—between the SLT and the TLT<sup>15</sup>; quality resides in how a translator negotiates or manages these  $\approx$  gaps and what he or she makes of them as a qualified semantic sameness is maintained via difference (e.g., in TLT form, culture, and readership ethnographies). A better-than-the-English word for these gaps is the Spanish *desencuentro* (disencounter or un-meeting), explored by Kaplan in his article "Un puñado de genios y el difícil arte de la traducción" (A handful of geniuses and the difficult art of translation). For him, the challenge of translating McCarthy resides in the fact that "en la prosa de este autor los puntos de desencuentro entre las diversas lenguas aparecen en mayor número que en la de otros autores" (in this author's prose the instances of dis-encounter between different languages occur in greater number than in that of other writers). <sup>16</sup> For that reason, "No hay autor que me haya hecho apreciar tanto el trabajo de un traductor" (there is no other author who has so made me so appreciate a translator's work).

#### Renditions of the Title: SLT-E $\approx Y^{1-2} \approx S^{1-4}$

During the bioptic stage  $(Y^1/S^1)$  of Murillo Fort's literary translation of *The Sunset Limited: A Novel in Dramatic Form*, several options were considered for the title, primary among them *EL* 

SUNSET LIMITED (Novela con estructura teatral), which included a rendition of the subtitle (BT: Novel with Theatrical Structure). The HBO title in the Spanish subtitling (S3) is a full-on translation, relying on a cross-cultural explanatory interpolation, to El expreso del atardecer (BT: The Late Afternoon/Evening Express [Fast Train]). The dubbed Spanish title (S4), evidently by a different translator than that of the subtitle, is El tren Sunset Limited (BT: The Sunset Limited Train). This dubbed rendition does not translate away the proper name of the train, as occurs in S<sup>3</sup>, yet it does make explicit that the Sunset Limited is indeed a train, which the S<sup>3</sup> subtitle does only obliquely via the metonymic expreso, and which the SLT title does not do at all, making the English-language reader wait until page 26 to understand that "the Sunset Limited [a train] comes through at eighty mile a hour." The bioptic stage literary translation  $(Y^1/S^1)$  by Murillo Fort hews far closer to the SLT wording for the main title, and has been shifted the least of the three final renditions  $(Y^2/S^{2-4})$  to El Sunset Limited: Novela con estructura teatral. In the end, however, the post-publication autopsy reveals that Murillo Fort (or publisher Random House Mondadori in Barcelona) brought closure to the in-process hesitancy regarding title options by deciding to publish it  $(Y^2/S^2)$  as simply El Sunset Limited, which harkens back to the original play script title by omitting the SLT subtitle that recategorizes it as a blended genre. Strictly considered, Murillo Fort's literary translation of the title is more technically that of the play rather than the "novel in dramatic form." Table 1 shows the movements of the SLT-E title into  $Y^{1-2}$  and  $S^{1-4}$ , all of which are successful renditions by means of different translation solutions (TS), as pprox sameness of meaning is conveyed explicitly or obliquely via different forms.

Figure 1 maps how  $\approx$  sameness of meaning in TLT-Y<sup>1-2</sup> and S<sup>1-4</sup> is maintained despite their differences in form; i.e., there can be different ways (a shift in parts of speech and syntax) to express, arguably enough, the same thing. Other differences—e.g., phonetic, semantic, receptor/readership, cultural, ethnographic—are assumed and are not included in this particular

SLT-E (Title)

TABLE 1 Translation Movements of SLT-E, the Title, into TLT- $Y^{1-2}$  and  $S^{1-4}$ 

	The Sunset Limited: A No	ovel in Dramatic Form	
Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup> : Literary Translation-in- Progress (Bioptic Stage)	Y <sup>2</sup> /S <sup>2</sup> : Literary Translation—Final (Autopsy Stage)	S³: Subtitle Translation	S <sup>4</sup> : Dubbing Translation
EL SUNSET LIMITED (Novela con estructura teatral)	El Sunset Limited	El expreso del atardecer	El tren Sunset Limited
BT: The Sunset Limited (Novel with Theatrical Structure)	BT: The Sunset Limited	BT: The Late Afternoon [Early Evening] Express [Fast Train]	BT: The Sunset Limited Train
TS: Partial translation, retains foreignizing SLT name of train, includes subtitle	TS: Minimal shift, retains foreignizing SLT name of train, translates only definite article, omits subtitle	TS: Full translation with explicitation, omits foreignizing name of train and subtitle	TS: Partial translation with explicitation, retains foreignizing SLT name of train, omits subtitle

*Note*: TS = translation solution.

		EL SUNSET LIMITED (Novela con estructura teatral)
The Sunset Limited: A Novel in Dramatic		El Sunset Limited
Form	≈	El expreso del atardecer
		El tren Sunset Limited
		TLT-Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup> : Literary Translation-in-Progress (Bioptic Stage)
SLT-E	≈	TLT-Y <sup>2</sup> /S <sup>2</sup> : Literary TranslationFinal (Autopsy Stage)
		TLT-YS <sup>3</sup> : Subtitle Translation
		TLT-YS <sup>4</sup> : Dubbing Translation

#### FIGURE 1

Sameness  $(\approx)$  of meaning maintained despite differences in form and sequence (parts of speech and syntax)

contrastive mapping of how in translation the properties of sameness and difference can collapse into one another as synonymic outcomes. The part-of-speech and syntactic mapping can heuristically reapply a basic equation methodology—SLT-E  $\approx$  S¹, SLT-E  $\approx$  S², SLT-E  $\approx$  S³, and SLT-E  $\approx$  S⁴; therefore, S¹  $\approx$  S², S¹  $\approx$  S³, S²  $\approx$  S³, and so on—to other such contrastive analyses.¹8 Yet such mapping, which can indeed be useful for visualizing aspects of the transformational mechanics and genre-driven norms at work,¹9 remains insufficient in terms of explaining the art and phenomenology of the process, which has more to do with how  $\approx$  is determined by any given translator at any given time.

#### Renditions of Character Names: Protagonist, Antagonist, and a Hypothetical

The two main characters in *The Sunset Limited* are the protagonist, Black (played by black actors Coffey and Jackson), and his antagonist, White (played by white actors Pendleton and Jones). The names Black and White are not proper names, as in Mr. Black and Prof. White (White is a professor of humanities, one infers, of philosophy, although he identifies himself as a "professor of darkness") (140), rather, they are used to contrast the Weltanschauung of hope versus despair. Subverting the traditional Western color symbolism of black as despair/depression/death and white as hope/optimism/life, it is, ironically, Black who speaks for a way forward in this allegorical cautionary tale, trying to persuade White to "[s]tay on the platform with your fellow commuter" (133), while White, a "terminal commuter" ("I yearn for the darkness. I pray for death. Real death") (126, 135), wishes only to board his suicide train, the Sunset Limited. As surnames, Black and White would make nontranslation an obvious foreignizing solution: simply retain them in Spanish as they are in English.<sup>20</sup> But the fact that they are not last names and that they, instead, represent a black-and-white clash of philosophies opens up a space of hesitancy in the translation process by allowing a domestication solution to counter that of foreignization via surname retention, i.e., to convert Black into Negro and White into Blanco. Table 2 shows how Murillo Fort moves his translation of Black and White from foreignization in  $Y^1/S^1$ , the translation-influx, to domestication in the final publication of  $Y^2/S^2$ . This suggests a naturalization tendency in translation poetics in Spain in large publishing houses such as Random House Mondadori.<sup>21</sup> This translation issue in The Sunset Limited occurs only for the literary translation because it would be superfluous for the stage and movie performances per se to provide names for the two

TABLE 2 Translation Movements of SLT-E, Character Names, into TLT-Y $^{1-2}$  and S $^{1-4}$ 

SLT-E
Black (Protagonist), White (Antagonist), and Cecil (a Hypothetical)

Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup> : Literary Translation-in- Progress (Bioptic Stage)	Y <sup>2</sup> /S <sup>2</sup> : Literary Translation—Final (Autopsy Stage)	S³: Subtitle Translation	S <sup>4</sup> : Dubbing Translation
Black, White, Dennis TS: Nontranslation for Black and White, substitution name for Cecil (based on cultural and reader ethnography considerations)	Negro, Blanco, Cecil TS: Translation domestication of Black and White, retention of SLT Cecil ("not an easy word" for the average Spanish reader)	Cecil TS: Black/White, Blanco/Negro not applicable, as their names do not appear in print; retention of SLT Cecil	Cecil TS: Black/White, Blanco/ Negro not applicable; retention of SLT Cecil, pronounced Se'-sil (stressed as in English) in Spanish, yet the long ē is transposed into a short ě

*Notes*: Highlight in  $Y^1$  and  $Y^2$  shows changes from  $Y^1$  to  $Y^2$ . TS = translation solution.

characters. Also, the audiences of the play and movie always see that Black is a black actor and that White is a white one.

The translation of the first name Cecil, "a hypothetical . . . a person [White] made up to illustrate a point" (11), has a different kind of hesitancy in Murillo Fort's literary translation movement from  $Y^1/S^1$  to  $Y^2/S^2$ . The Spanish translator first considered rendering Cecil as Dennis, "un nombre menos comprometido para el lector español" (a less problematic name for the Spanish reader), which would amount to translation via substitution, justified on cultural and ethnographic (readership) grounds. As Murillo Fort further clarifies,

I didn't choose Dennis for any particular reason at all. That name rang some unconscious bell, I guess. Now, Cecil is not an easy word to (silently) spell for the average Spanish reader.<sup>23</sup> Being that it didn't really matter whether it was Cecil or Gregor or James (the name wouldn't appear later in the original text [and so therefore it had no real significance in and of itself]), I considered the possibility of a replacement.<sup>24</sup>

As Table 2 shows, however, Dennis reverts back to Cecil, a foreignizing (nontranslation) strategy that is presumably truer to the SLT. This same translation solution is used in the film subtitling and dubbing, the latter of which provides the correct foreignized pronunciation stress of the name in English embedded in the Spanish dubbing. The English name Cecil is therefore pronounced  $\mathbf{S}\check{\mathbf{e}}'$ -sil in Spanish, retaining the first-syllable word stress of the original English, although with the long  $\bar{\mathbf{e}}$  sound replaced by the short  $\check{\mathbf{e}}$ . For the Spanish to be pronounced like Cecil in English, it would have to be spelled something like Sísil ( $\mathbf{S}\check{\mathbf{e}}'$ -sil). In writing in Spanish, the foreignized English pronunciation would have to be indicated with an accent mark as Cécil ( $\mathbf{S}\check{\mathbf{e}}$ -sil), as otherwise the word Cecil would be stressed conventionally on the second syllable as Se- $\mathbf{s}il'$ . Furthermore, for Spanish readers from Spain, the letter c in Cecil would be pronounced mentally as an s only by those Spaniards who use the seseo (pronunciation of the letters c and c as an s).

For many other Spaniards, primarily those from central and northern Spain, the letters c and z are pronounced as the *theta* (the phoneme  $\theta$ , as in the English word **th**ank, when spelled  $\theta$ , or z + vowel), such that Cecil may in effect becomes **Thě'**-thil, which it would for the literary translator from Barcelona. This serves as an illustration of how even nontranslation can in fact become quite problematic and how a word in an SLT is no longer really the same word in a TLT, despite being graphically identical. There is no such thing as one and the same word across languages; such exactitude is a nostalgic delusion. <sup>25</sup>

#### **Renditions of Untranslatable Dialectal Diction**

The characteristics of Black's untranslatable idiodialectal diction have been analyzed in detail in the biopsy. The autopsy at hand is concerned instead with the movements and effects of this manner of speaking into TLT- $Y^{1-2}$  and  $S^{1-4}$ , which will exemplify variation in literary translation; i.e., seldom will different professional translators (with different ethnographies, idiodialects, experience, audience, etc.) translate exactly alike. Idiodialectal diction foregrounds the problematics of translating in the gaps—the desencuentro terrain of imperfect  $\approx$  sameness—between the SLT and the TLT, as dialect, regionalect, and diction are sui generis markers of difference between themselves and any other forms of expression. Black's American English regionalectal diction, most often a linguistically substandard (e.g., ungrammatical) "blend of rural deep-South and urban East-Coast inner city, the latter layered over the remnants of the Louisiana deep structures of his formative years,"26 is to be found nowhere else but in Black's character in English, first in print (where the reader in English must imagine its sounds), then as pronounced aloud by the actors (who impose their own tendencies and choices regarding sound). It does not exist in Spanish because it cannot; in this case, the desencuentro between English and Spanish is culturolinguistically unbridgeable. Here, translator Gregory Rabassa's experience-tested observation about the exclusive conceptual capabilities of different languages can be applied also to regionalect (in which what is substandard at times shifts toward nonstandard diction because the substandard diction becomes the generalized norm in the regionalect) and manner of expression: "Some concepts [styles or manners of expression] seem to be the exclusive property of one language and cannot be rightly conceived [expressed] in another."27 As Table 3 shows, idioregionalectal diction, because of the impossibility of re-creating it in translation, is often what gets translated away, leaving it to the reader or spectator, then, to somehow supply (which would be the ideal aesthetic response!) a peculiar manner of utterance, at least suggestive (if not accurately reminiscent) of a unique quality in the SLT. In Black's case in the Spanish versions under examination, this can only be achieved by readership and audience recognitions; for instance, of the The Sunset Limited as a work of literature by American literary icon Cormac McCarthy, a southerner (they must know who McCarthy is and what makes his writing distinctive); Black as a transplanted, rural southerner from Louisiana, now an ex-con residing in a New York City ghetto; Black as a black man with no formal education, etc. If The Sunset Limited is to be spared from being flattened by translation into a generic, hybrid, and standardized diction, that is, into something it never was to begin with, such collaborative acknowledgment on the part of the reader/spectator will have to fill in the dialectal desencuentro between the SLT and the TLT potentiality. This is what must occur, in a redemptive sense (Steiner's "restitution," Venuti's "remainder"), when a translator, editor, or publisher resorts heavy-handedly to domestication, a widely adopted methodological convention when it comes to translating dialect.<sup>28</sup> The reader/spectator must become more imaginative and play a more overt and activated role in the translation, supplying what has been omitted. Reading a literary translation is really not for the lazy.

 ${\bf TABLE~3} \\ {\bf Translation~Movements~of~SLT-E,~Black's~Untranslatable~Diction~and~Dialect,~into~TLT-Y^{1-2}~and~S^{1-4} }$ 

#### **SLT-E (p. 3)**

## I done told you. This aint none of my doing. I left out of here this morning to go to work you wasnt no part of my plans at all. But here you is.

Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup> : Literary Translation-in-Progress (Bioptic Stage)	Y <sup>2</sup> /S <sup>2</sup> : Literary Translation—Final (Autopsy Stage)	S³: Subtitle Translation (2:00 <sup>*</sup> )	S <sup>4</sup> : Dubbing Translation (2:00)
Esta mañana cuando he salido de aquí pa' ir al curro usté no entraba en mis planes. BT: This morning when I left here t'go to my job ye didn't enter into my plans. TS: Attempts to suggest something about Black's idiodialectal diction via substandard orthography of "pa'" and "usté." "Curro" for "work" or "job" tags the translation as being into Peninsular slang, and since it is slang that we are dealing with, it succeeds in its effort to substitute one slang for another. The ye repeats McCarthy orthography from other novels such as Outer Dark, Suttree, and Blood Meridian, where substandard	Esta mañana cuando he salido de aquí para ir al curro usted no entraba en mis planes. BT: This morning when I left here to go to my job you didn't enter into my plans. TS: The substandard apocope of "pa" and "usté" is corrected to conform to conventional Spanish and translation method (in Spain, or at least with Mondadori). With the exception of the slangy "curro," McCarthy's dialectal style is domesticated and translated away into proper Spanish.	cuando salí a trabajar esta mañana, usted no estaba en mis planes, pero ahora sí. BT: When I left to work this morning, you weren't in my plans, but now you are. TS: Full translation with explicitation; McCarthy's style is completely domesticated and translated away into proper Spanish; the Spanish eludes a nostalgia-motivated back-translation into the style of SLT-E.	cuando salí a trabajar  ≈ esta mañana, usted no era parte de mi plan, pero aquí está.  BT: When I left to work this morning, you weren't a part of my plan, but here you are.  TS: Partial translation with explicitation; McCarthy's style is completely domesticated and translated away into proper Spanish, as even the dubbing diction is a neutral Latin American Spanish; again, the Spanish eludes nostalgia-motivated back-translation into the style of SLT-E.

Notes: Highlight in  $Y^1$  and  $Y^2$  shows changes from  $Y^1$  to  $Y^2$  and from  $S^3$  to  $S^4$ . TS = translation solution.

Only in the bioptic stage of the literary translation is there any real attempt to make something of Black's SLT nonstandard idioregionalect. In the end, domestication qua macro-dialectal (either Peninsular or Latin American) orthographic naturalization and conventionalization is

<sup>\*</sup>The subtitle and dubbing "spotting" or "cueing" list indicates the precise moments when they appear on screen (hour, minutes, and seconds of movie time; e.g., 1:17:12 occurs at one hour, seventeen minutes, and twelve seconds in the movie). For more on the semiotics, technical considerations (e.g., page 88+), conventions, linguistics, and translation issues for subtitling, see Díaz Cintas and Remael, *Audiovisual Translation: Subtitling*.

imposed on all the final products. The living dialectal tissue  $(Y^1-S^1)$  of the bioptic stage of the translation is dead and gone by the time of this autopsy.

## Renditions of Agreement and Skeptical Irony: Nonverbal "Mm Hm" and "Mm" Interjections

Black's phonetic, nonverbal interjections of "Mm hm" and "Mm" represent a seldom analyzed aspect of reproducing dialogue in literary translation. Such interjections are loaded in terms of their meaning, "ranging from full to partial agreement and skeptical irony."<sup>29</sup> Translation method in these instances may vary from phonetic, nonverbal transfer (i.e., moving the pprox nonverbal form from the SLT to its conventional TLT expression) to shifting what is a nonverbal sound into an actual word (difference of form) that functions the same as a nonverbal interjection (a qualified sameness) to outright omission from the translation. In the literary translation into his Peninsular Spanish, Murillo Fort generally opts for sameness in terms of sound-form-function; that is, a transfer from nonverbal interjection into pprox nonverbal interjection, with the addition of the wonderfully idiomatic, intensifying "ya" or "ya, ya" (right / yeah, right). The film subtitling and dubbing generally omit the interjections in Table 4. What is missing in the film adaptation is the much more nuanced manner of graphic expression in Murillo Fort's literary translation, which plays richly on the reader's eye and ear. This, however, is compensated for by the facial expressions, gestures, and vocal tones of the actors, which respond exclusively to the representational mode of the filmic genre and stand in intersemiotically for the written interjections that have been deleted. At times the SLT "hm" (26) is rendered by Murillo Fort in  $Y^2/S^2$  as "hum" (21, the h is silent in Spanish, such that the pronunciation in English would be "oom"), which is also omitted in both S<sup>3</sup> and S<sup>4</sup>.

#### Renditions of Slang: From "Chippied" and "Honey" to "Honky Ass" and "No, It Aint"

The following word string by Black represents a confluence of semantic, hermeneutic, and crosscultural challenges for the literary and filmic translator: "the point is I done tried it the other way. And I dont mean chippied, neither. Runnin blindfold through the woods with the bit tween your teeth. Oh man. Didnt I try it though" (14). The key slang word is "chippied," which in Black's ex-con world means to get half a high on drugs. This semantic notion of moderation—of exercising some modicum of self-control by achieving only a mild buzz—is how "chippied" shapes the meaning of the rest of the passage. The translator's task is to transculturate this meaning and its manner of expression, a unique challenge because slang is a form of language that epitomizes renowned translator Gregory Rabassa's conviction that "in even the best of examples a translation cannot get to the marrow of what has been said in the original. A piece of writing cannot be cloned in another language, only imitated."30 Murillo Fort's second translation option, a semantic corrective to his initial in-flux mistranslation of "Y no me estoy refiriendo a ir con fulanas y tal" (And I'm not referring to loose women and the like), was to explicitate the meaning of "chippied" via "Y no me estoy refiriendo a medio drogado. Y no crea que fueron cuatro canutos de nada, no" (And I'm not referring to half stoned/high. And don't you think it was just four joints of any old shit, no way). Murillo Fort's hesitancy is finally resolved by yet a third possibility, "a lo bestia" (literally, like a beast = to the max/all out), which he explained as follows: "Since 'chippied' means what it means, I decided no mention of 'porros' or 'canutos' [joints] or any other direct reference to drugs was the best solution. 'A lo bestia' is very colloquial, matches with Black's Spanish diction, and leaves the reader to imagine what could he possibly be talking about."31

**TABLE 4** Translation Movements of SLT-E, "Mm Hm" and "Mm" Interjections, into TLT- $Y^{1-2}$  and  $S^{1-4}$ 

#### SLT-E (pp. 3-4)

Black: I done told you. This aint none of my doing. I left out of here this morning to go to work you wasnt no part of my plans at all. But here you is.

White: It doesnt mean anything. Everything that happens doesnt mean something else.

Black: <u>Mm hm.</u> It dont. White: No. It doesnt.

Black: What's it mean then?

White: It doesnt mean anything. You run into people and maybe some of them are in trouble or whatever but it doesnt mean that you're responsible for them.

Black: Mm hm.

Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup> : Literary Translation-in- Progress (Bioptic Stage) (p. 2)	Y <sup>2</sup> /S <sup>2</sup> : Literary Translation—Final (Autopsy Stage) (pp. 7–8)	S³: Subtitle Translation (2:10)	S <sup>4</sup> : Dubbing Translation (2:10)
Mm-mm Mm-mm	Same as Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup>	Both interjections omitted from the movie subtitles	First interjection omitted from the movie, second one foreignized as "Mm hm," as pronounced in English with the aspirated h
BT: Mm hm	BT: Same as Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup>	BT: N/A	BT: Mm hm for second interjection
TS: Transculturates the English spelling and pronunciation "hm" to the Spanish "mm"	TS: Same as Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup>	TS: Omission	TS: Partial translation with foreignizing English pronunciation of the interjection in Spanish

#### SLT-E (p. 11)

Black: Who's Cecil?

White: He's not anybody. He's just a hypothetical . . . There's not any Cecil. He's just a person I made up to illustrate a point.

Black: Made up. White: Yes. Black: <u>Mm.</u>

Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup> : Literary Translation-in- Progress (Bioptic Stage) (p. 8)	Y <sup>2</sup> /S <sup>2</sup> : Literary Translation—Final (Autopsy Stage) (p. 12)	S³: Subtitle Translation (6:22)	S <sup>4</sup> : Dubbing Translation (6:22)
Mm-mm	Same as Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup>	Omitted from the movie subtitle	Omitted from dubbing
BT: Mm hm	BT: Same as Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup>	BT: N/A	BT: Same as S <sup>3</sup>

TS: Doubles the "mm" sound rather than retain the same single "mm" solution

TS: Same as Y<sup>1</sup>/S<sup>1</sup>

TS: Omission

TS: Same as S<sup>3</sup>

#### SLT-E (pp. 28-29)

Black: That's about all you got in the way of friends.

White: Yes.

Black: Mm. Well. If that's the best friend you got then

I reckon that's your best friend. Aint it?

White: I don't know.

Black: What did you do to him. White: What did I do to him?

Black: Yeah.

White: I didnt do anything to him.

Black: Mm hm.

Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup> : Literary Translation-in- Progress (Bioptic Stage) (p. 21)	Y <sup>2</sup> /S <sup>2</sup> : Literary Translation—Final (Autopsy Stage) (p. 23)	S³: Subtitle Translation (16:10)	S <sup>4</sup> : Dubbing Translation (16:10)
Mm-mm Mm-mm.Ya	Same as Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup> Mm-mm. Ya, ya	Omitted	Same as S <sup>3</sup>
BT: "Mm hm" and "Mm hm, right"	BT: "Mm" and "Mm hm, yeah, right"	BT: N/A	BT: Same as S <sup>3</sup>
TS: Addition of "Ya" (Right, Sure, Sure thing, Of course; Oh, I see, etc.) emphasizes interjection's greater degree of skeptical irony	TS: Interjection's degree of skeptical irony is heightened via the redoubled, wonderfully idiomatic "Ya, ya"	TS: Omission, together with entire line "Mm. Well. If that's the best friend you got then I reckon that's your best friend. Aint it?"	TS: Same as S <sup>3</sup>

Notes: Highlight in  $Y^1$  and  $Y^2$  shows changes from  $Y^1$  to  $Y^2$ . Interjection underline added for clarity. N/A = not applicable; TS = translation solution.

Once again, the reader is invited into the process of literary translation, this time to reexperience meaning only obliquely in the TLT, reliving a vagueness of understanding that characterizes the SLT reader's apprehension as well. The sameness lies in the reading experiences in which the fundamental meaning, a lack of moderation, is conveyed via two dissimilar forms, each of which comprehends the ambiguous "it" in "Didnt I try it though" (the pronoun referring to either halfway or all the way): "And I don't mean chippied" (halfway) and "I mean I went crazy wild" (all the way). This hermeneutic portal of ambiguity was opened further by Amanda Urban, Cormac McCarthy's agent, when her assistant's e-mail response to Murillo Fort's query was that "they didn't know what the word 'chippied' meant," understood by the translator as "it means whatever you want it to mean." Murillo Fort's translation method here, then, is simply to clarify, via the less oblique yet similarly slangy and antonymic route of a lo bestia, what McCarthy means by his more elusive lexical choice ("chippied") for the negation of moderation. The film dubbing

also does a very nice job of capturing the synonymic-route meaning of "chippied" with "I don't mean trot." The subtitle, however, fails utterly with its nonsensical mistranslation ( $\neq$  in Table 6) "No pienso irme tampoco" (I don't think I'm leaving/going that way, either), proving once again the folly of "translating" what one does not fully understand. As Table 5 shows, both the subtitle and the dubbing translations fall short of the more polished consistency of Murillo Fort's literary translation, whose "galopando a ciegas" (galloping blindly) for "running blindfold," for example, conveys more of the original spirit of breakneck abandonment than the subtitle's "vendado, corriendo" (blindfolded, running), which is slowed by the insertion of the comma, or the dubbing's similar, even more measured pacing in "trotar, es decir, con los ojos cerrados" (to trot, that is to say, with my eyes closed).

Among other illustrative literary translation challenges in this process-to-product and intersemiotic closure are the slang words and phrases "honey," "ball park," "busted out," "the dozens," "third railers," and "trick bag." "Honey," which Black explains to White, who has inquired "[W]hy do you keep calling me honey" (70), as "just the old south talkin [. . .] It means you among friends. It means quit worryin bout everthing" (70–71), is indeed a curious American endearment regionalism for "pal," "buddy," "bro," or "friend." Black's explanation of its meaning is an example of how McCarthy frequently incorporates intralingual translation into his own creative writing as a rather prominent stylistic signature.<sup>33</sup> The various renditions given for "honey" in Table 6 are *criatura*  $\approx cariño \approx cielo$ , all three of which succeed as synonymic choices.

The synonymic renditions given for "ball park" (15) in Table 7 are  $Asi\ a\ voleo\ \approx Un\ aproximado$ , with the literary translation's "a voleo" (volleyed/kicked, passed back [by foot]) achieving exemplary success in transculturating the semantic field of American baseball to that of soccer in Spain (and, by extension, in Latin America). The sports context is not translated away, as occurs with the "un aproximado" (rough estimate) in  $S^3$  and  $S^4$ . Indeed, in the movement from  $Y^1/S^1$  to  $Y^2/S^2$ , one culturally quintessential sport, baseball, is adroitly replaced by another, soccer, providing both the SLT and TLT readers with a shared general context, that of sports, with the bonus of localizing the specific sport for each. To the further credit of Murillo Fort's literary rendition, the kicking/passing action captured by  $a\ voleo\ enhances$  the rapid back-and-forth of the dialog beyond that of the SLT static "ball park" location.

"Busted out" is variously rendered in Table 8 as  $le\ revento \approx se\ le\ fue \approx no\ le\ funcionaron$  (burst/exploded/blew up  $\approx$  got away  $\approx$  didn't function/work for you). The context is that of the ex-con Black concluding that for White "all this culture stuff is all they ever was tween you and the Sunset Limited [. . .] But it busted out on you" (27), that is, it failed White when it broke free or away from his control, as if breaking/busting out (a jailbreak) from a prison.

In another example of McCarthy's signature intralingual translating, "the dozens," which is "really just a discussion," is slang for "when two of the brothers stands around insultin one another and the first one gets pissed off loses" (72). More precisely, "the dozens is part of an African-American custom of verbal sparring, of 'woofin' and 'signifyin,' intended to defuse conflict amicably, descended from an oral tradition rooted in traditional West African cultures" and "[p]laying the dozens is an African-American custom in which two competitors—usually males—go head to head in a competition of comedic trash talk. They take turns 'cracking on,' or insulting, one another, their adversary's mother or other family member until one of them has no comeback."<sup>34</sup> Table 9 shows how Murillo Fort resolves this semantic and cultural issue. A more literal BT is provided to demonstrate the intralingual distance covered in Spanish from denotative to figurative language.

Murillo Fort, after initially leaving the epithet "third railers" (for those who, like passenger White, are suicidal) untranslated in the in-flux  $(Y^1/S^1)$  draft as "el resto de los **third railers**," briefly

(Continued)

 $\begin{tabular}{ll} $\sf TABLE~5 \\ $\sf Translation~Movements~of~SLT-E,~Slang~("Chippied"),~into~TLT-Y^{1-2}~and~S^{1-4} \\ \end{tabular}$ 

[T]he point is I done tried it the other way. And I dont mean chippied, neither. Runnin blindfold through the woods with the bit tween your

SLT-E (p. 14)

Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup> : Literary	teetn. On man. Didnt i try it though. If you can find a soul that give it a better shot than me i d like to meet nim. I surely would. .iterary	ter shot than me i'd like to meet nim.	i sur	ely would.
Translation-in-Progress (Bioptic Stage) (p. 10)	$Y^2/S^2$ : Literary Translation—Final (Autopsy Stage) (p. 14)	S <sup>3</sup> : Subtitle Translation (7:33)		S <sup>4</sup> : Dubbing Translation (7:33)
El caso es que yo lo probé pero	El caso es que yo lo probé pero por la otra	El punto es que no lo intento de la		El punto es que traté de correr
por la otra vía. Y no me estoy $\neq$	vía. Y quiero decir a lo bestia. Era como $\neq$	otra forma. No pienso irme	#	al otro lado y no me refiero a
refiriendo a ir con fulanas y tal.	un caballo desbocado, un semental	tampoco. Digo vendado,		trotar, es decir, con los ojos
Madre mía. Pero vaya si no lo	galopando a ciegas por el bosque.	corriendo por el bosque,		cerrados, dientes apretados.
intenté. Si encuentra a alguien	Madre mía. Vaya si no lo intenté. Si	apretando los dientes Señor,	<b>}</b> }	Dios, ¡vaya que traté! Si
que haya puesto más empeño	encuentra usted a alguien que haya	iqué si lo intenté! Si encuentra a		encuentra a alguien que lo
yo, me lo presenta. Caso de	puesto más empeño yo, me lo presenta.	alguien que lo intentó más que		haya intentado más que yo,
que lo encuentre.	Caso de que lo encuentre.	yo, me gustaría conocerlo, en		me gustaría conocerlo,
		verdad.		seguro que sí.
BT: The case/point is that I tried	BT: The case/point is that I tried it but the	BT: The point is that I don't try it		BT: The point is that I tried to
it but the other way. And I'm	other way. And I mean I went wild [e.g.,	the other way. I don't think I'm		run to the other side and I
not referring to loose women	crazy wild, at it with complete	leaving [going that way/going		don't mean trot, with my eyes
and the like. Good heavens	abandonment, unbridled, etc.]. I was like	there (figuratively?)], either. I'm		closed, teeth gritted together.
[e.g., Sweet mother of Jesus,	a runaway horse, a stud galloping	saying blindfolded, running		Lord, I sure gave it a try. If you
Good Lord, etc.]. But didn't I	blindly [on a rampage, etc.] through the	through the forest, gritting my		find somebody who might
give it a try, though. If you find	forest. Good heavens [e.g., Sweet	teeth Lordy, didn't I try it! If		have tried harder than me,
someone who has tried harder	mother of Jesus, Good Lord, etc.].	you find someone who tried		I would like to meet him,
than me, please introduce him	I certainly gave it a try. If you find	harder than me, I would like to		that's for sure.
to me. In the event you do	someone who has tried harder than me,	meet him, truly would.		
find someone.	please introduce him to me. In case/the			
	event you do find someone.			

TABLE 5 (Continued)

[T]he point is I done tried it the oth teeth. Oh man. Didnt I try it though	SLT-E (p. 14) [T]he point is I done tried it the other way. And I dont mean chippied, neither. Runnin blindfold through the woods with the bit tween your teeth. Oh man. Didnt I try it though. If you can find a soul that give it a better shot than me I'd like to meet him. I surely would.	SLT-E (p. 14) er way. And I dont mean chippied, neither. Runnin blindfold through the woods with the bi i. If you can find a soul that give it a better shot than me l'd like to meet him. I surely would.	ods with the bit tween your I surely would.
Y¹/S¹; Literary Translation-in-Progress	Y <sup>2</sup> /S <sup>2</sup> : Literary Translation—Final		
(Bioptic Stage) (p. 10)	(Autopsy Stage) (p. 14)	S <sup>3</sup> : Subtitle Translation (7:33)	S <sup>4</sup> : Dubbing Translation (7:33)
TS: Attempts to match Black's	TS: Succeeds in matching Black's dialectal	TS: Mistranslation. Difficult to	TS: "Trotar" (to trot) does not
dialectal slang via the	slang via the substitution slang of "a lo	comprehend how "chippied"	succeed in retaining the slang
substitution slang of "fulanas	bestia"(crazy wild [excess]), which	can be mistranslated as "No	quality of "chippied," yet it
y tal" (loose women and the	effectively recuperates the meaning in a	pienso irme tampoco" (I don't	ties in very well with the
like), which initially	transculturated (localized) manner.	think I'm leaving [going that	horse image, which in turn is
mistranslates the semantic		way/going there], either).	not more fully exploited via
meaning, although the gist			compensation and
meaning remains.			explicitation as in $Y^2/S^2$ ("a
			stud galloping blindly")

Notes: Highlight in  $Y^1$  and  $Y^2$  shows changes from  $Y^1$  to  $Y^2$  and  $S^3$  to  $S^4$ . TS = translation solution.

TABLE 6 Translation Movements of SLT-E, Slang ("Honey"), into TLT-Y $^{1-2}$  and S $^{1-4}$ 

Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup> : Literary Translation-in- Progress (Bioptic Stage) (pp. 10, 52)	Y <sup>2</sup> /S <sup>2</sup> : Literary Translation—Final (Autopsy Stage) (pp. 13, 49)	S³: Subtitle Translation (7:19, 46:14)	S <sup>4</sup> : Dubbing Translation (7:19, 46:14)
Criatura (10)	Same as Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup>	Omitted in first instance, p. 10 of Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup> and p. 13 of Y <sup>2</sup> /S <sup>2</sup> (Sé que no lo entiende, —)	Cariño ("Sé que no, cariño")
		Cariño (¿Por qué me dice "cariño"?)	≈ Cielo ("¿Y por qué me llama cielo")
BT: Creature, critter	BT: Same as Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup>	BT: N/A; Dear	BT: Dear; angel/darling
TS: Attempts to match Black's dialectal slang via substitution slang	TS: Succeeds in matching Black's dialectal slang via substitution slang, which retains the meaning in a transculturated (localized) manner	TS: Omission followed by successful substitution	TS: Succeeds with a two-for-one slang substitution, as "honey" becomes both "cariño" and "cielo," the latter of which is a strikingly successful rendition

Notes: Highlight in  $Y^1$  shows changes from  $Y^1$  to  $S^3$  to  $S^4$ . TS = translation solution.

 $\begin{tabular}{ll} TABLE\ 7\\ Translation\ Movements\ of\ SLT-E,\ Slang\ ("Ball\ Park"),\ into\ TLT-Y^{1-2}\ and\ S^{1-4}\\ \end{tabular}$ 

Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup> : Literary Translation-in-Progress (Bioptic Stage) (p. 11)	Y <sup>2</sup> /S <sup>2</sup> : Literary Translation—Final (Autopsy Stage) (p. 14)	S³: Subtitle Translation (8:23)	S <sup>4</sup> : Dubbing Translation (8:23)
Así a voleo (after an initial consideration of the banal "aproximadamente")	Same as Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup>	Un aproximado	Same as S <sup>3</sup>
BT: Pass/kick [soccer] your guesstimate back to me	BT: Same as Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup>	BT: A rough estimate	BT: Same as S <sup>3</sup>
TS: Attempts to match the sports context of Black's dialectal slang	TS: Succeeds in matching the sports context of Black's dialectal slang, excellent example of relocalization in literary translation	TS: Explicitation of meaning, loses the dialectal slang	TS: Same as S <sup>3</sup>

*Note*: TS = translation solution.

TABLE 8 Translation Movements of SLT-E, Slang ("Busted Out"), into TLT-Y $^{1-2}$  and S $^{1-4}$ 

Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup> : Literary Translation-in- Progress (Bioptic Stage) (p. 20)	Y <sup>2</sup> /S <sup>2</sup> : Literary Translation—Final (Autopsy Stage) (p. 22)	S³: Subtitle Translation (14:51)	S <sup>4</sup> : Dubbing Translation (14:51)
Pero le reventó en las ≈ manos	Pero se le fue de las amanos	Pero se le escapó $pprox$	Pero no le funcionaron (grammatical context: todas estas cosas culturales [all those cultural things])
BT: But it burst/exploded/blew up in your hands	BT: But it got/slipped away from [between] your hands	BT: But it escaped/got away from you	BT: But they didn't function/work out for you
TS: Attempts to capture the imagery of "busted out" as a bursting, blowing up, or wrecking of something; retains slangy feel, although loses SLT prison/jailbreak context	TS: While not as vivid an image, hews closer perhaps, in a figurative or slangy manner, to the sense while avoiding outright explicitation	TS: Explicitation, fails to retain slang quality of "busted out" but does a nice job of retaining SLT prison/jailbreak context	TS: Outright explicitation, fails to retain slang quality of "busted out," loses SLT prison/jailbreak context

*Notes*: Highlight in  $Y^1$  and  $Y^2$  shows changes from  $Y^1$  to  $Y^2$  and  $S^4$ . TS = translation solution.

considered two possible renditions: "casos duros" and "tíos conflictivos."<sup>35</sup> "Third railers" (128) are the exception, the "terminal [terminally ill with depression] commuter" (126) who prefers to take the Sunset Limited to "the depot" (129) rather than "[s]tay on the platform [of life] with your regular commuter" (133). In Table 10 we see how Murillo Fort's final solution tags the Spanish slang, as the word *tio* for "guy/dude" is glaringly Peninsular. He did not consider a literal translation of "tercer carril," which in any event would not harmonize as matching railroad slang in Spanish. The notion of cross-cultural harmonization is triggered by Kaplan's "Un puñado de genios," in which he maintains that it is the *melodía* (melody) of the SLT that should endure in a translation. If we consider slang as the melody of colloquial diction and idiodialect—which must ring true to both ear and eye of the listener and the reader—then this "ringing true" (the *slang-eme*) is what must be conveyed in the translations of *The Sunset Limited*. Murillo Fort generally excels in doing so.

The various renditions given for "trick bag"—as in "[y]ou think I'm fixin to put you in the trick bag" (43), "[y]ou tryin to put me in the trick bag, Professor" (67), "that aint the way to the trick bag" (128), and "[t]he trick bag seems to have shaped itself up into some sort of communal misery" (128)—are provided in Table 11. "Trick bag" generally means a "sticky situation." Within the prison slang used by ex-con Black, it refers more specifically to "a situation where one prisoner attempts to frame, set up, blackmail, extort, or abuse another weaker inmate, usually through seemingly innocent acts or requests" as in "Marcus got Jeff in a real trick bag, got

**TABLE 9** Translation Movements of SLT-E, Slang ("the Dozens"), into TLT- $Y^{1-2}$  and  $S^{1-4}$ 

Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup> : Literary Translation-in- Progress (Bioptic Stage) (p. 53)	Y <sup>2</sup> /S <sup>2</sup> : Literary Translation—Final (Autopsy Stage) (pp. 50–51)	S³: Subtitle Translation (x:x)	S <sup>4</sup> : Dubbing Translation (x:x)	
Rosquillas (Cada vez que las rosquillas se ponen un poco feas)	Same as Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup>	Omitted (abridged from White's "What else" on p. 71 to Black's "No, I dont play the dozens" on p. 74)	Same as S <sup>3</sup>	
BT: Smoke ring/ ring-shaped pastry/ doughnut → a circular game of trading insults	BT: Same as Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup>	BT: N/A	BT: Same as S <sup>3</sup>	
TS: Attempts to match Black's dialectal slang via substitution slang	TS: Succeeds in matching Black's dialectal slang via substitution slang, which recaptures the meaning in a transculturated (relocalized) manner	TS: Omission	TS: Same as S <sup>3</sup>	

Note: TS = translation solution.

TABLE 10 Translation Movements of SLT-E, Slang ("Third Railers"), into TLT-Y $^{1-2}$  and S $^{1-4}$ 

Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup> : Literary Translation-in-Progress (Bioptic Stage) (p. 95)	Y <sup>2</sup> /S <sup>2</sup> : Literary Translation — Final (Autopsy Stage) (p. 86)	S³: Subtitle Translation (x:x)	S <sup>4</sup> : Dubbing Translation (x:x)
Casos duros (El resto de los ≈ third railers [casos duros])	Tíos conflictivos	Omitted (abridged from White's "You think that anyone" on p. 127 to Black's "You wont be here" on p. 130)	Same as S <sup>3</sup>
BT: Hard/tough/ challenging cases/people	BT: Conflicted/tortured souls	BT: N/A	BT: Same as S <sup>3</sup>
TS: Explicitates Black's dialectal slang via a figurative substitution that is nowhere near as slangy as the SLT, train context lost completely	TS: Addition of the Peninsular slang <i>tio</i> makes this rendition more slangy via a transculturated (localized) substitution, but the train context is irretrievably lost, as in Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup>	TS: Omission	TS: Same as S <sup>3</sup>

Notes: Highlight in  $Y^1$  and  $Y^2$  shows changes from  $Y^1$  to  $Y^2$ . TS = translation solution.

TABLE 11 Translation Movements of SLT-E, Slang ("Trick Bag"), into TLT-Y  $^{1-2}$  and S  $^{1-4}$ 

Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup> : Literary Translation-in-Progress (Bioptic Stage) (pp. 31, 49, 96)	Y <sup>2</sup> /S <sup>2</sup> : Literary Translation—Final (Autopsy Stage) (pp. 31, 47, 86)	S³: Subtitle Translation (26:10; 43:35)	S <sup>4</sup> : Dubbing Translation (26:10; 43:35)
Chinitas, as in "poner chinitas en el zapato" (after having first considered "poner a alguien en un brete": "Se cree que quiero ponerle en un brete," p. 31; "Ahora es usté el que quiere ponerme en un brete, profesor," p. 49; "Ya, pero no es la manera de poner a alguien en un brete," p. 96; and "parece que el famoso brete ha adoptado la forma de una suerte de desdicha comunitaria," p. 96)	Chinitas ("Se imagina que intento ponerle chinitas en el zapato," p. 31; "Ahora va usted y quiere ponerme chinitas a mí," p. 47; "esa no es forma de poner chinitas en el zapato," p. 86; and "parece que nuestro querido zapato ha adoptado la forma de una suerte de desdicha comunitaria," p. 86)	Bolsa de trucos (Cree que voy a meterlo a la bolsa de trucos; ¿Intenta meterme en la bolsa de trucos?; third and fourth examples abridged, from White's "You think that anyone" on p. 127 to Black's "You wont be here" on p. 130)	Bolsa (Cree que quiero echármelo a la bolsa; ¿Trata de tenerme en la bolsa?); same omission as S <sup>3</sup>
BT: Make somebody feel uncomfortable: (You think I'm trying to make you feel uncomfortable, p. 31; Now you're the one who wants to make me feel uncomfortable, professor, p. 49; Okay, but that's not the way to make someone feel uncomfortable, p. 96; it seems like the famous uncomfortable situation has adopted/taken on the form of some kind of community unhappiness/misfortune, p. 96)	BT: Put pebbles in one's shoes (i.e., make somebody feel uncomfortable): (You think I'm trying to put some pebbles in your shoes, p. 31; Now you're the one who wants to put some pebbles in my shoes, p. 47; that's not how you put pebbles in someone's shoes, p. 86; it seems like our dear/good old shoe has adopted/taken on the form of, p. 86)	BT: Bag of tricks/trick bag: (You believe/think I'm going to put you in the trick bag; Are you trying to put me in the trick bag?)	BT: Bag: (You believe/think that I want to put you in the bag ["echármelo" is wonderfully idiomatic with no equivalent formal expression in English: literally "echar" (put), "me" (me/to me, indirect object pronoun, often added for subtle emphasis), "lo" (you, direct object pronoun) ≈ I myself want to put you]; Are you trying to keep me in the bag?)

TS: Attempts to match
Black's dialectal slang
via use of an informal
register; while figurative,
not as slangy as the SLT;
loses important prison
context

TS: Succeeds better in matching Black's ex-con dialectal slang via the slangy/folksy sound/image of pebbles, which reinforces the consistency of Black's diction and tone elsewhere, as in "the sun don't shine up the same dog's ass ever day" (p. 43), "[t]hat's strong as a mare's breath" (p. 69), and "you can jack you own self around nine ways from Sunday" (p. 129); still loses prison context

TS: Literal translation, which makes no sense culturally in Spanish, a good example of linguistic desencuentro, back-translates into the English "trick bag," which of course does make sense; loses prison context

TS: Truncated literal translation, retains bag while dropping the modifier "trick," which is the adjective that makes Black's American English slang so distinctive; loses prison context

Notes: Highlight in  $Y^1$  and  $Y^2$  shows changes from  $Y^1$  to  $Y^2$  and  $S^3$  to  $S^4$ . TS = translation solution.

him to carry those drugs and then informed on him."<sup>36</sup> This sense of the phrase fits perfectly with the argumentation contest between Black and White, as Black is always apprehensive that the more formally educated and articulate professor is continually trying to set him up to give a contradictory or losing answer. Thematically, this "novel in dramatic form" is all about the power and drama of words, playing the dozens on a different conceptual plane, as Black bemoans his lack of the appropriate words with which to persuade White not to commit suicide: "If you [Jesus] wanted me to help him how come you didn't give me the words? You give em to him. What about me?" (142). Murillo Fort's final solution of "chinitas" (pebbles) works much better as a matching slang than the less vivid and off-register "brete" (uncomfortable situation/pinch/fix), yet falls short of cross-cultural correspondence to the SLT prison slang.

The biopsy article expressed misgivings that Murillo Fort's

solution of "chinitas" may not apply in every instance when "trick bag" appears, as "brete" seems to work better in examples such as "You think I'm fixin to put you in the trick bag" (43), "Se cree que quiero ponerle en un brete" (p. 31 of 8/29/11 draft) or "And then put me in the what was it? The trick bag?" (50), "Ponerme en qué fue lo que me dijo, ¿en un brete?" (p. 37 of 8/29/11 draft).<sup>37</sup>

Such reservations were shared with Murillo Fort during the in-flux process stage of the literary translation before seeing the skill with which he subsequently resolved any issue of consistency in the final publication of *The Sunset Limited*. In this sense, literary translation criticism as autopsy typically trumps, as it should, the bioptic stage of analysis during which process (hesitancy) is examined as it is still being reworked toward a final product (closure).

Additional illustrative examples of how the various translators of *The Sunset Limited* manage slang and informal register in their Spanish renditions are provided in Table 12 and in the appendix. The latter's subtitle and dubbing also give an idea of the extent of McCarthy's considerable adaptation abridgements (sameness/difference) from his novel to the film. The various translations are successful in different ways and to varying degrees. The basic equation methodology modeled earlier for purposes of part-of-speech and syntactic mapping—a "choice among synonyms" as SLT-X  $\approx$  Z<sup>1</sup>, SLT-X  $\approx$  Z<sup>2</sup>, SLT-X  $\approx$  Z<sup>3</sup>, and SLT-X  $\approx$  Z<sup>4</sup>; therefore, Z<sup>1</sup>  $\approx$  Z<sup>2</sup>, Z<sup>1</sup>  $\approx$  Z<sup>3</sup>, Z<sup>2</sup>  $\approx$  Z<sup>3</sup>, and so on—could be applied in a similarly illustrative manner to these contrastive analyses as well, showing myriad ways in which translation's characteristic sameness/difference prevail.

#### **Conclusion: A Legitimate Expectation**

Numerous other examples of the challenges of transporting Black's American slang into Spanish are in Murillo Fort's literary translation and HBO's movie subtitles and dubbing. *The Sunset Limited* is, in effect, an exercise and a lesson in the translation of slang as represented in the writing of McCarthy. Murillo Fort always works as a thorough translator, transculturating and relocalizing the SLT idiodialect into his own Barcelona-rooted Spanish. In effect, he always Spanishes Black's SLT English, taking it into how things would or could be said cross-idiomatically in Peninsular Spanish, for instance (slang underlined when necessary, page numbers from the Mondadori publication):

<u>I reckon</u> what I don't understand is how come you to get yourself in such a fix" (5) becomes "Será que no entiendo cómo ha podido meterse en semejante lío" (9) (It must be that I don't understand how you have been able/managed to get yourself in such a fix/fuss/muddle). Note that "reckon" is very idiomatic American English, meaning to consider/think/calculate (*considerar/pensar/calcular* in Spanish), and "[s]erá que" is a very successful compensation via a grammatical shift from the English subject + active verb to the Spanish passive verb + relative pronoun. "How come you to get yourself" is a complex slang anastrophe that is captured well enough by "cómo ha podido meterse," although the distinctively nonstandard syntax used by Black is translated away into a more conventional Spanish, while "lío" tags the translation as being into Peninsular slang.

- "I'm serious as a heart attack" (9), in response to "You can't be serious," becomes a very idiomatic "Por mis muertos que sí" (11) (BT: Yes, by my dead  $\rightarrow$  I swear it on the graves of . . .).
- "Mindin my own business" (23) becomes the very Peninsular "A mi bola" (19) (At/Minding my ball  $\rightarrow$  Doing my own thing).
- "Haulin ass" (23) becomes the very Peninsular "a toda leche" (19) (at full milk  $\rightarrow$  like a bat out of hell).
- "You a culture junky" (27) becomes the very Peninsular "es un friqui cultural" (19) (You're a culture freak).
- "Where people can <u>crash</u>" (39; sleep) becomes the very Peninsular "donde se queda gente a sobar" (28–29) (where people stay to sleep; slangy).
- "Of course they goin to carry off your portables" (39) becomes the very Peninsular "Te chorizan todo lo que se pueden llevar" (29) (They nick/steal from you everything they can carry off).
- "I got that <u>big sucker yonder</u>. <u>Traded up</u>" (39) becomes "Ahora tengo ese <u>mamotreto</u> de <u>ahí all fondo</u>. Decidí <u>mejorar</u> de <u>nevera</u>" (29) (Now I've got that monstrosity/big sucker there in the back. I decided to improve/trade up my fridge; "mejorar" and "nevera" [an addition/explicitation] are a combined effective compensation for the difficult-to-translate "traded up").

**TABLE 12** Translation Movements of SLT-E, Slang (Miscellaneous Examples), into TLT- $Y^{1-2}$  and  $S^{1-4}$ 

#### SLT-E (p. 23)

Black: So what are we sayin here? You lookin at some big black angel got sent down here to grab your honky ass out of the air at the last possible minute and save you from destruction?

Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup> : Literary Translation-in- Progress (Bioptic Stage) (p. 17)	Y <sup>2</sup> /S <sup>2</sup> : Literary Translation—Final (Autopsy Stage) (p. 19)	S³: Subtitle Translation (12:35)	S <sup>4</sup> : Dubbing Translation (12:35)
Bien. Entonces ¿qué? ¿Soy una especie de ángel negro grandullón que ha bajao del cielo pa' agarrar del culo a un blanco in estremis y así salvarlo de la destrucción?	Bien. Entonces, ¿qué? ¿Soy una especie de ángel negro grandullón que ha bajado del cielo para agarrar del culo a un blanco in extremis y así salvarlo de la destrucción?	¿Qué dice, que ve un gran ángel negro enviado aquí para sacarlo de ahí en el último minuto y salvarlo?	≈ ¿Qué está diciendo, que un gran ángel negro fue enviado aquí a atrapar su trasero en el aire en el último minuto y salvarlo de la destrucción?
BT: Then what? Am I some kind of oversized/huge/great big black angel who come down from the heavens t'grab a white man by his ass at the very last moment and (thus/thereby) save him from	BT: Same as Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup> , but without any foreignizing substandard ungrammaticality or spelling to suggest SLT-E dialectal diction	BT: What are you saying, that you see a great big black angel sent here to get you out of there [pull you off the train platform] at the last minute and save you?	BT: What are you saying, that a great big black angel was sent here to trap/grab/catch ["atrapar" as in to catch fish] your bottom/behind in the air at the last minute and save you from destruction?
destruction? TS: Successful compensation, has convincing sound and feeling of slang, attempts to capture some of Black's idiodialect via the elisions, which suggest substandard and nonstandard regionalect diction	TS: Same as Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup> ; the substandard orthography of "bajao" and "pa"" is corrected/domesticated to conform to conventional Spanish; "angel negro grandullón" is a very successful compensation with the -ón augmentative, even more vivid than the SLT	TS: McCarthy's style is completely domesticated and translated away into proper Spanish	TS: McCarthy's style is largely domesticated, but "atrapar su trasero" ("trasero" is a euphemism for the more graphic SLT "ass" and the Y¹/S¹ and Y²/S² "culo") goes far beyond S³ in suggesting some of the SLT idiodialect

(Continued)

 TABLE 12 (Continued)

#### SLT-E (p. 41)

## Black: You had brothers in there that had done some real bad shit and they wasn't sorry about a damn thing cept gettin caught.

Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup> : Literary Translation-in-Progress (Bioptic Stage) (pp. 29–30)	Y <sup>2</sup> /S <sup>2</sup> : Literary Translation—Final (Autopsy Stage) (p. 30)	S³: Subtitle Translation (24:42)		S <sup>4</sup> : Dubbing Translation (24:42)
Allí dentro había hermanos que habían hecho cosas muy gordas y les importaba todo una higa. Solo les preocupaba estar en la trena.  BT: There were brothers in	Same as Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup> BT: Same as Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup>	Había hermanos que hicieron cosas bien malas. Pero no lamentaban nada, más que de ser atrapados. BT: There were	$\approx$	Había hermanos allí que habían hecho cosas muy malas. Sólo se arrepentían de que los atraparon. BT: There were brother
there who had done some very fat [bad] things and they didn't give a fig [hoot/damn/shit/fuck] about anything. They were only worried/gave a damn about being in jail/prison.	Di. Junic us 1 /3	brothers who did some very bad things. But they weren't sorry about anything except getting trapped [caught].		there who had done some very bad things They were only sorry that they [the pólice/authorities] trapped [caught] them.
TS: Successful idiomatic compensation, loses the distinctive American scatological image, recuperates loss with very effective rendition of "damn thing" as "higa" and "cept gettin caught" as "estar en la trena"	TS: Same as Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup>	TS: McCarthy's style is completely domesticated and translated away into proper Spanish		TS: Same as S <sup>3</sup>

#### SLT-E (p. 43)

#### Black: What, are you shittin me?

Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup> : Literary Translation-in-Progress (Bioptic Stage) (p. 31)	Y <sup>2</sup> /S <sup>2</sup> : Literary Translation—Final (Autopsy Stage) (p. 31)	S³: Subtitle Translation (25:55)		S <sup>4</sup> : Dubbing Translation (25:55)
Oiga, ¿se está cachondeando de mí o qué?	Same as Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup>	¿Está jugando conmigo?	$\approx$	¿Está bromeando?
BT: Listen/Hey, are you making fun of me or what?	BT: Same as Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup>	BT: Are you playing around with me?		BT: Are you kidding/joking?

TS: Tags the translation as	TS: Same as Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup>	TS: Retains a minimal	TS: Translates only the
being into Peninsular		trace of the	meaning, fails to
slang, yet translates		figurative element	retain any slang
away the distinctive		characteristic of	quality, translates
American scatological		slang, but not nearly	away the scatological
image because this is		as slangy as Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup> ;	image
simply not how Spanish		translates away the	
handles "shit" (mierda)		scatological image	

SLT-E (p. 62)

#### White: . . . to me the whole idea of God is just a load of crap.

Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup> : Literary Translation-in-Progress (Bioptic Stage) (p. 46)	Y <sup>2</sup> /S <sup>2</sup> : Literary Translation—Final (Autopsy Stage) (p. 44)	S³: Subtitle Translation (39:37)		S <sup>4</sup> : Dubbing Translation (39:37)
a mí la idea de Dios me parece una chuminada	Same as Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup>	para mí eso de Dios es pura tontería	≈	para mí la idea de Dios es un montón de basura
BT: To me the idea of God seems like a bunch of nonsense/rubbish	BT: Same as Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup>	BT: For me that thing about God is pure rubbish/nonsense		BT: For me the idea of God is a bunch of garbage/rubbish
TS: Successful compensation, equally slangy in Peninsular Spanish; again, Spanish does not use "crap/shit" the same way English does	TS: Same as Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup>	TS: Successful compensation, somewhat slangy in generic Spanish but less so than Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup> and Y <sup>2</sup> /S <sup>2</sup>		TS: Successful compensation, slangy in generic Spanish, a bit more so than S <sup>3</sup> but less so than Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup> and Y <sup>2</sup> /S <sup>2</sup>

SLT-E (p. 81)

#### Black: What about them other folks tryin to off theyselves

Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup> : Literary Translation-in-Progress (Bioptic Stage) (p. 59)	Y <sup>2</sup> /S <sup>2</sup> : Literary Translation—Final (Autopsy Stage) (p. 57)	S³: Subtitle Translation (51:43)		S <sup>4</sup> : Dubbing Translation (51:43)
¿Qué me dice de la otra gente que intenta darse el finiquito?	Same as Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup>	¿Y los otros que intentan terminarse?	$\approx$	¿Qué hay del resto de los suicidas?
BT: What do you say/can you tell me about the other people/folks who want to give themselves the end/put an end to it all?	BT: Same as Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup>	BT: And the others who try to terminate/end themselves/put an end to themselves/end their lives?		BT: What about the rest of the suicides/suicidal people/folks?

(Continued)

 TABLE 12
 (Continued)

SLT-E (p. 81)

Black: What about them other folks tryin to off theyselves

Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup> : Literary Translation-in-Progress (Bioptic Stage) (p. 59)	Y <sup>2</sup> /S <sup>2</sup> : Literary Translation—Final (Autopsy Stage) (p. 57)	S³: Subtitle Translation (51:43)	S <sup>4</sup> : Dubbing Translation (51:43)
TS: Successful compensation, equally slangy in Peninsular Spanish; "Qué me dice de" also works very well for "What about"	TS: Same as Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup>	TS: Oddly successful compensation, sounds somewhat slangy in generic Spanish but less convincingly so than Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup> and Y <sup>2</sup> /S <sup>2</sup> ; "terminarse" resonates very effectively with White as a "terminal commuter" (but may also jar by bringing to mind the "terminator")	TS: Successful compensation, equally slangy in Spanish except for "suicidas," which resorts to explicitation of what is already understoo in the SLT slang

### White: Pulling your chain

Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup> : Literary Translation-in-Progress (Bioptic Stage) (p. 70)	Y <sup>2</sup> /S <sup>2</sup> : Literary Translation—Final (Autopsy Stage) (p. 64)	S³: Subtitle Translation (54:55)		S <sup>4</sup> : Dubbing Translation (54:55)
Me estaba quedando con usté	Me estaba quedando con usted	Sólo estoy bromeando	$\approx$	Solo lo estoy molestando
BT: I'm just stayin with you/making an impression on you; extremely figurative, contemporary Peninsular slang	BT: Same as Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup>	BT: I'm just kidding/joking		BT: I'm just bothering/ messing with you
TS: Wonderfully successful compensation, equally slangy in Peninsular Spanish but loses SLT imagery; tags the translation as being into Peninsular slang	TS: Same as Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup> , does not retain the foreignizing elision of Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup>	TS: Explicitation of the SLT slang		TS: Explicitation of the SLT slang, but more slangy and vivid than S <sup>3</sup>

## SLT-E (p. 124) White: Is your life the one you'd planned? Black: No, it aint.

Y<sup>2</sup>/S<sup>2</sup>: Literary Y<sup>1</sup>/S<sup>1</sup>: Literary Translation—Final **Translation-in-Progress** S3: Subtitle (Autopsy Stage) S4: Dubbing (Bioptic Stage) (p. 92) Translation (1:13:25) (p. 83) **Translation (1:13:25)** Same as Y<sup>1</sup>/S<sup>1</sup> White: ¿Su vida es como White: ¿Usted vive la White: ¿Esta es la vida usted la había previsto? vida que planeó? que usted planeó? Black: No lo es. Black: Nones. Black: No. BT: Is your life like you had BT: Same as Y<sup>1</sup>/S<sup>1</sup> BT: Are you living the BT: This is the life you foreseen it would be? life you planned? No. planned? It is not. Nope/no way [Jose?]/nooo . . . TS: Wonderfully successful TS: Same as Y<sup>1</sup>/S<sup>1</sup> TS: Omits "it aint," TS: Differs from S<sup>3</sup> in thereby dodging the that it does not omit compensation, equally "it aint," which it slangy in Spanish but SLT slang loses substandard renders in Spanish as dialectal quality of the the nonslang, SLT; tags the translation conventional "is not" as being into Peninsular slang

*Notes*: Highlight in  $Y^1$  and  $Y^2$  show changes from  $Y^1$  to  $Y^2$  and  $S^3$  to  $S^4$ . Slang words or phrases are underlined. TS = translation solution.

<sup>&</sup>quot;A bunch of niggers" (47) becomes the very Peninsular "un hatajo de negratas" (34).

<sup>&</sup>quot;We done opened a <u>can of worms</u> here?" (54) becomes the equally idiomatic "¿Hemos abierto la caja de los truenos?" (38) (box of thunder).

<sup>&</sup>quot;Lots of friends was <u>drinkers</u>" (56) becomes the very Peninsular "A muchos amigos míos les iba la priva" (40).

<sup>&</sup>quot;He liable to put the mojo on me" (64) becomes the very Hispanic "Igual va y me echa mal de ojo (45) (evil eye).

<sup>&</sup>quot;Now I'm fixin to whip your ass" (74) becomes the very Peninsular "ahora mismo te parto la crisma (52) (right now I'll split your head wide open).

<sup>&</sup>quot;Drunk as a goat" (57) becomes the very Peninsular "Que está como una cuba" (41) (drunk as a cask/barrel).

<sup>&</sup>quot;That's <u>well put</u>" (76) becomes the very Peninsular "Ahí sí que <u>ha dado en la diana</u>" (19) (Now there you have hit the bullseye).

<sup>&</sup>quot;You pretty smart for a <u>cracker</u>" (100) becomes the idiomatic "Para ser un <u>blancucho</u> es usted bastante listo" (68), with "blancucho" echoing nicely the pejorative ring of "cracker."

<sup>&</sup>quot;<u>Dumb-ass</u> reasons" (120) becomes "razones de tarado mental" (68) (moronic/stupid-ass reasons).

<sup>&</sup>quot;Where you come up with <u>stuff</u> like that?" (128) becomes the very Peninsular "¿De dónde saca esas paridas si se puede saber" (86) (dumb ideas/silly remarks).

The net effect is a consistent and convincing domesticating of Black's diction, striving always to match the slang-ring of his American English with that of Murillo Fort's Peninsular Spanish, often one that matches the SLT time period (Black, White, and Murillo Fort are all in their mid- to late 50s, so much of their slang would date from the 1970s and 1980s). Overall, Murillo Fort succeeds admirably in this endeavor, demonstrating a sharp eye and ear for substituting Peninsular Spanish slang for Black's colorful American English slang. One may not endorse Random House Mondadori's methodological preference of domestication over foreignization, but once such naturalization is adopted as a translation strategy, Murillo Fort delivers a consistent literary product. Also, foreignization is never really absent, as it subtly permeates his translation in other ways, via the setting in a New York City ghetto, the name of the train, etc.

In contrast, the subtitles and dubbing are often much more literal or explicitated translations of Black's English, yielding somewhat unidiomatic-sounding, foreignized renditions, or at times outright mistranslations, as the SLT English wording too often shows itself despite the changing of the words into Spanish (English in Spanish disguise<sup>38</sup>), as in the final few examples.

- "Serious as a heart attack" (9) becomes the literal, Anglicized, but not convincingly idiomatic (e.g., for Spain and South America) dubbing "Tan serio como un ataque cardiaco" (4:58) (BT: As serious as a cardiac/heart attack) and subtitle "Serio como un infarto" (Serious as an infarction/heart attack).
- "I love the way you <u>put that</u>" (60) becomes the literal dubbing "Me gustó cómo <u>puso eso"</u> (38:55) (I liked how you <u>put that</u>). What is understood in English despite the elision, "put that [into words]," is not necessarily what one would understand in Spanish with the same words elided, although it could be, in an Anglicized manner as "puso eso [en palabras]." Rather than resort to a literal, and what would be an unidiomatic rendition in Peninsular Spanish, Murillo Fort simply uses explicitation in a short, idiomatic sentence: "Me encanta como lo ha dicho" (42) (I am delighted by/I love how you said/put it).
- "That's the hand I'm playin" (60) becomes the word-for-word dubbing, using the very same syntax, "esa es la mano que estoy jugando" (39:25). Similar to the previous example, it is not at all a given that the idiomatic elision in the "hand [of-cards] I'm playin" will be understood the same way in Peninsular Spanish, such that, again, Murillo Fort resorts, more appropriately for his Peninsular readership, to a short, idiomatic explicitation of "Esas son mis cartas" (43) (Those are my cards).
- "Soul food" (98) becomes a literal, nonsensical subtitle with "Es comida del alma" (food of the soul), similarly mistranslated in the dubbing as "Es comida para el alma" (58:22) (food for the soul). Murillo Fort provides a lesson in translation in this instance, resorting to explicitation that "soul food" is "un guiso tradicional de los negros del Sur" (67) (a traditional stew/dish/plate for blacks from the South). In any event, the subtitle and dubbing would do better to suggest that the kind of food being fed to the soul is fatback, chitlins, chicken gizzards, collard greens, okra, hushpuppies, cornbread, sweet potato pie, and the like.
- "[Y]ou think I'm full of shit" (117) becomes the literal dubbing "cree que estoy lleno de mierda" (1:08:42), an unidiomatic wording (in Spain and other Spanish-speaking countries) behind which the scatological English "shit" is made awkwardly audible as the Spanish "mierda"; for his Peninsular readership, Murillo Fort renders it via an idiomatic explicitation as "piensa que lo que digo son disparates" (79) (you think what I'm saying is nonsense/stupid). The lesson here is that often enough the better way to say "shit" in Spanish is to stay away from "mierda."

The net result for the HBO movie, like an interest accumulated in the subtitle and dubbing accounts, is a distinctively Americanized (U.S.) Spanish, often strikingly different from how a native speaker of Spanish from Spain or South America would say things idiomatically. In the end, both filmic translations succeed to varying degrees. Translation's sameness/difference obtains throughout. It is still *The Sunset Limited* that we encounter in the different Spanishes of the book and the movie, but never altogether the same one. Murillo Fort, as could be expected, gives his reader a bona fide literary translation, consistently more carefully crafted and polished, i.e., much more McCarthy-like in the details, which is what one would expect translated literature to do. Yet the subtitles and dubbing, subject to genre conventions such as time and space constraints and created for a different audience than the readership of El Sunset Limited, also work well enough, although unevenly, for what they are. Often enough, for example, the dubbing provides wonderfully successful and idiomatic matches: Black's folksy line "That's strong as a mare's breath" (69) becomes "Es más fuerte que una patada de burro" (45:19) (That's stronger than a donkey kick); "I've knowed drunks to lift the tops off of toilet tanks in strange places just on the off chance" (102) becomes "Conozco a ebrios que levantan las tapas de sanitarios en casas ajenas por si las dudas" (1:00:22), in which "por si las dudas" (just because of doubts/in case [their doubts prove untrue]) works very well for "off chance"; and "My heart warms just thinking about it" (136) becomes a nicely idiomatic "Mi corazón salta al pensar en ello" (1:18:27), rewarding us with its own compensatory elision of de alegría (My heart jumps [for joy] at the thought of it / Mi corazón salta [de alegría] al pensar en ello). When one watches the movie, the missing idioregionalect can be inferred by the spectator who hears the entonations of Black's (Samuel L. Jackson's) dubbed voice, a sharp contrast to that of professor White (Tommy Lee Jones). The filmic genre plays to its own compensatory strength, as the reader of Murillo Fort's literary translation never actually hears the sounds of an idioregionalect but instead is left to imagine them, insofar as possible. Black's dubbed tone of voice is an effective shift that manages to remind the viewer that he or she is indeed in the presence of an idioregionalect, although it is always distant from the one used by Samuel L. Jackson in the SLT movie. Unfortunately, the dubbing high points are dragged down occasionally by glaring inconsistencies, which should have been avoided; for example, the "colony" in "moral leper colony" (76) becomes "colina" (47:35) (hill) rather than colonia, and "manual override" (107) becomes "en automático" (1:02:33) (on automatic/autopilot), just the opposite of the SLT meaning, which Murillo Fort renders correctly as "a control manual" (73).

This autopsy, a literary and film coda, brings closure to the process hesitancy that characterized Murillo Fort's working drafts of the literary translation. The language and wording of *The Sunset Limited* is no longer unstable, in flux. It has been finalized, fixed, at least until other published renditions appear, if indeed they do over time. *El Sunset Limited* (Murillo Fort), *El expreso del atardecer* (subtitle), and *El tren Sunset Limited* (dubbing) show contrastively what became of *The Sunset Limited* when it was moved from the author's highly stylized American English into distinctive Spanish dialects and idioregionalects. Different translators, different genres and their conventions, different solutions. Different ways to express arguably enough the same thing. Translation's terrain of imperfect  $\approx$  sameness allows for such a diversity of successful renditions: SLT-E  $\approx$  S<sup>1</sup>, S<sup>2</sup>, S<sup>3</sup>, and S<sup>4</sup>. Black/Negro is never quite the same across languages. Nor should that be a legitimate expectation of getting it right in an art of inexactitude.

#### **ABOUT THE AUTHOR**

**Michael Scott Doyle** is a professor of Spanish and translation studies at the University of North Carolina at Charlotte, where he chaired the Department of Foreign Languages from 1993 to 1999. He

also served as graduate coordinator (1999–2003 and 2005–2009) and director of the undergraduate and graduate Certificates in Translating and Translation Studies (2000–2012). He received his PhD in Spanish from the University of Virginia in 1981. For more information, please visit https://languages.uncc.edu/people/michael-scott-doyle.

#### **NOTES**

- 1. Doyle, "A Translation Biopsy." The concluding line in the article is "A postmortem coda now awaits" (104). The full title of McCarthy's genre-blended work is *The Sunset Limited: A Novel in Dramatic Form*.
  - The range of novelists Murillo Fort has translated includes Cormac McCarthy (nine of his eleven novels), Dashiel Hammett, Barry Gifford, Richard Russo, John LeCarré, Anne Rice, Jean Sasson, Nicholson Baker, Kelly Jones, Philip Pullman, James Carlos Blake, Mary Higgins Clark, Nicholas Evans, Jonathan Franzen, Deborah Eisenberg, James Salter, Evelyn Waugh, and David Vann, among others.
- 2. Doyle, "A Translation Biopsy," 80.
- 3. During the bioptic shadowing process, early to late-stage drafts of Murillo Fort's literary translation were examined with threaded commentary from the translator, via e-mail, marginal notes, and responses to queries in his manuscript. Murillo Fort had referred to this methodology as "peering through my window from the outside, a witness to a translation work in progress" (e-mail correspondence, August 22, 2011). Electronic communications continued during this subsequent autopsy.
- **4.** Doyle, "A Translation Biopsy," 80.
- 5. The translation process biopsy took place between August and November 2011; Murillo Fort's final translation product, which is the subject of this literary translation autopsy, was published by Random House Mondadori in February 2012.
- 6. In response to a request for assistance in confirming the Spanish dialects used in the HBO movie subtitles and dubbing, translation and film studies scholar and translator Anton Pujol (from Barcelona) responded that to his eye and ear it was "the same kind of Latino 'middle-of-the-road' that they use on HBO Latino. A no-man's-land kind of Spanish. To me, at times, it sounded more Mexican than anything else" (e-mail correspondence, August 2, 2012). Pujol checked further with two other colleagues, both professors of Spanish at the University of North Carolina at Charlotte. For the colleague from Colombia (Prof. María Lorena Delgadillo Latorre), it sounded like Mexican Spanish, yet for the colleague from Mexico City (Dr. Carlos Coria), "it did not sound Mexican at all." In sum, a generic, hybrid Latin American Spanish, truly from no man's (or no identifiable native-speaker Mexican's or Latin American's) land.
- 7. Rabassa, If This Be Treason, 12–13.
- 8. Information provided at the end of the October 2006 Vintage International Edition, n.p.
- **9.** Wood, "The Sunset Limited, by Cormac McCarthy," n.p.
- **10.** Movie dates are from the Internet Movie Database (IMDb), http://www.imdb.com/title/tt1510938/ (accessed July 9, 2012).
- 11. Although the dubbing recordist (Mark Purcell) is credited at the end of the movie (1:29:50), no such credit is given to the subtitle and the dubbing translators.
- 12. In "A Translation Biopsy," translating is described as "a striving for imperfect perfection, knowing that striking the perfect word or turn of a phrase is inevitably marked by the imperfection of difference. The perfection of sameness is unattainable" (103–4).
- 13. For more on an earlier methodological use of BT, see Doyle's "'A Whole New Style Seemed to Be Seeking Expression Here,' " 12, and "Five Translators Translating," 50.

- 14. Process resides in the translator working spaces known as hesitancy, as described and analyzed in Doyle's "A Translation Biopsy."
- 15. Renowned translator John Felstiner (*Translating Neruda*, 31) even questions whether translating from Spanish into Italian—two very similar languages with fewer gaps between them than the much more dissimilar Spanish and English, for example—is in fact translation, or to what extent it is really translation.
- **16.** Kaplan, "Un puñado de genios y el difícil arte de la traducción," *Literatura en los talones* (blog), February 22, 2012, http://literaturaenlostalones.blogspot.com.es/2012/02/un-punado-de-genios-y-el-arte-de-la.html?showComment=1341243328710#c5361307158258703305 (accessed August 1, 2012).
- 17. Doyle, "A Translation Biopsy," 84–85.
- **18.** Following is an example of the reapplication of basic equation methodology for sameness ( $\approx$ ) of meaning.

The Sunset Limited: A Novel in Dramatic Form	*	EL SUNSET LIMITED (Novela con estructura teatral)
		El Sunset Limited
		El expreso del atardecer
		El tren Sunset Limited
DA + CN (N + ADJ) + Col +	$\approx$	DA + CN (N + ADJ) + Open P +
IA + N + Prep + ADJ + N		N + Prep + N + ADJ + Close P
		DA + CN (N + ADJ)
		DA + N + Prep + N
		DA + N + CN (N + ADJ)

*Note*: ADJ = adjective;  $Close\ P = close\ parenthesis$ ;  $CN = compound\ noun$ ; Col = colon;  $DA = definite\ article$ ;  $IA = indefinite\ article$ ; N = noun;  $Open\ P = open\ parenthesis$ ; Prep = preposition.

- **19.** See Doyle, "Theoretical Foundations for Translation Pedagogy," 43.
- 20. As Moya indicates in his thorough study La traducción de los nombres propios (The translation of proper names), today's convention of nontranslation occurs because "la traducción ha pasado de ser un instrumento para mostrar las semejanzas interculturales a ser un vehículo para sacar a relucir las singularidades de la cultura de origen, como la forma de pensar y expresarse de sus gentes y, por supuesto, su peculiar manera de denominar a los suyos y a sus lugares" (180) (translation has moved from being an instrument that shows intercultural similarities to being a vehicle that highlights the originating culture's singularities, such as the manner by which its people think and express themselves, and of course, their peculiar way of denominating themselves and their places).
- 21. This tendency was resisted by Murillo Fort during his early translation drafts, as indicated in his e-mail to me of September 31, 2011: "I received first proofs only last week. I sent them back with my comments. Actually there were very minor changes made, some of which I accepted, some I didn't. Now I'm waiting for a second batch to come. All in all, I'll probably regret not having been allowed to have it my way, even knowing it [the Spanish I first proposed using] was kind of weird or un-standard."
- 22. Page 8 of Murillo Fort's August 27, 2011, translation draft manuscript of *The Sunset Limited*.

- 23. Other difficulties that the name Cecil represents for the reader in Spanish are addressed in Doyle's "A Translation Biopsy."
- **24.** Murillo Fort, e-mail correspondence, July 13, 2012.
- 25. This is well established, for example, by Ortega y Gasset in "The Misery and Splendor of Translation," when he maintains that "it is utopian to believe that two words belonging to different languages, and which the dictionary gives us as translations of each other, refer to exactly the same objects" (96); by Burton Raffel in *The Art of Translating Poetry,* 11–12; and by Mildred L. Larson in *Meaning-based Translation: A Guide to Cross-language Equivalence*.
- **26.** Doyle, "A Translation Biopsy," 89.
- 27. Rabassa, If This Be Treason, 6.
- 28. In "La traducción de dialectalismos en los textos literarios" (The translation of dialectalisms in literary texts) Belén Hernández has written that

[l]as técnicas consentidas hoy para reproducir los dialectalismos en la lengua de llegada rechazan la sustitución de un dialecto por otro, aunque éste pueda representar una variedad lingüística paralela en la segunda lengua. Tampoco es satisfactorio acortar las palabras al final, con el objetivo de subrayar que se trata de un habla de campesino ignorante, por ejemplo. Es más adecuado producir un lenguaje jergal natural, para hacer entender que se trata de un dialectalismo, y re-procesar solamente una parte de las palabras del original, justamente las necesarias para hacer entender la función asignada al dialecto.

[the techniques commonly accepted today for reproducing dialectal usage in the receptor language reject the substitution of one dialect for another, even though the latter may represent a parallel linguistic variety in the second language. Nor is it satisfactory to cut off the endings of words with the purpose of emphasizing, for example, that one is dealing with the diction of an ignorant peasant. It is more appropriate to produce a jargon-like, natural language in order to convey that this is a dialectal usage taking place, and to re-process only selected words from the original text, only those deemed necessary to convey the function assigned to the dialect.]

The problem remains that for sui generis idiodialect there really is no "parallel linguistic variety in the second language."

- **29.** Doyle, "A Translation Biopsy," 91.
- **30.** Rabassa, If This Be Treason, 20.
- 31. Murillo Fort, e-mail correspondence, November 22, 2011.
- 32. Murillo Fort, e-mail correspondence, September 26, 2011, and November 22, 2011.
- **33.** For more on this, see section IV of "Five Translators Translating," 47–50.
- **34.** *Urban Dictionary*, s.v. "The Dozens," http://www.urbandictionary.com/define.php?term=dozens (accessed July 26, 2012).
- **35.** Marginal note of August 29, 2011, 95.
- **36.** *Urban Dictionary*, s.v. "Trick Bag," http://www.urbandictionary.com/define.php?term=trick%20bag (accessed July 26, 2012).
- 37. Doyle, "A Translation Biopsy," 101.
- **38.** This is very felicitious wording, suggested by one of the anonymous reviewers of this article.

#### **BIBLIOGRAPHY**

- DÍAZ CINTAS, JORGE, and ALINE REMAEL. *Audiovisual Translation: Subtitling*. Manchester, UK: St. Jerome Publishing, 2007.
- DOYLE, MICHAEL SCOTT. "Five Translators Translating: Reading *Blood Meridian* from English into English, Spanish into English, and English into Spanish." *Translation Review* 74 (2008): 35–66.
- . "Theoretical Foundations for Translation Pedagogy: Descriptive, Prescriptive, and Speculative (In Defense of the 'Good Utopian')." ADFL Bulletin 42, no. 1 (2012): 43–48.
- ——. "A Translation Biopsy of Cormac McCarthy's *The Sunset Limited* in Spanish: Shadowing the Re-Creative Process." *Sendebar* 23 (2012): 79–109.
- ——. "'A Whole New Style Seemed to Be Seeking Expression Here': Cormac McCarthy's *Outer Dark* in Spanish." *Translation Review* 72 (2007): 9–25.
- FELSTINER, JOHN. *Translating Neruda: The Way to Macchu Picchu*. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 1980. HERNÁNDEZ, BELÉN. "La traducción de dialectalismos en los textos literarios." *Tonos: Revista electrónica de estudios filológicos* 7 (2004). http://www.um.es/tonosdigital/znum7/estudios/gtraduccion.htm (accessed July 30, 2012).
- LARSON, MILDRED L. *Meaning-based Translation: A Guide to Cross-language Equivalence*. Lanham, MD: University Press of America, 1984.
- MCCARTHY, CORMAC. The Sunset Limited: A Novel in Dramatic Form. New York: Vintage International, 2006.
- . El Sunset Limited. Translated by Luis Murillo Fort. Barcelona: Random House Mondadori, 2012.
- ——. El Sunset Limited: Novela con estructura teatral. Translated by Luis Murillo Fort. E-mail to Michael S. Doyle, August 27, 2011.
- MOYA, VIRGILIO. La traducción de los nombres propios. Madrid: Ediciones Cátedra, 2000.
- ORTEGA Y GASSET, JOSÉ. "The Misery and Splendor of Translation." Translated by Elizabeth Gamble Miller. In *Theories of Translation*, edited by Rainer Schulte and John Biguenet, 93–112. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1992.
- RABASSA, GREGORY. If This Be Treason: Translation and Its Dyscontents. New York: New Directions, 2005.
- RAFFEL, BURTON. The Art of Translating Poetry. University Park: Pennsylvania State University Press, 1988.
- STEINER, GEORGE. After Babel: Aspects of Language and Translation. New York: Oxford University Press, 1975.
- VENUTI, LAWRENCE. "Translation, Community, Utopia." In *The Translation Studies Reader*, edited by Lawrence Venuti, 468–88. London: Routledge, 2009.
- WOOD, DANIEL. "The Sunset Limited, by Cormac McCarthy." The Quarterly Conversation 7 (2011). http://quarterlyconversation.com/the-sunset-limited-by-cormac-mccarthy (accessed July 9, 2012).

#### **Appendix**

Additional examples of how the various translators of *The Sunset Limited* manage slang and informal register in their Spanish renditions. The subtitle and dubbing also give an idea of the extent of McCarthy's considerable adaptation abridgements (sameness/difference) from his novel to the film.

	SLT-E	(p. 37)	
	White: Have you e Black: Married. White: Yes. Black: ( <i>softly</i> ) <u>Oh</u>	ver been married? man.	
Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup> : Literary Translation-in- Progress (Bioptic Stage) (p. 26)	Y <sup>2</sup> /S <sup>2</sup> : Literary Translation—Final (Autopsy Stage) (p. 27) Same as Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup>	S³: Subtitle Translation (21:50)	S <sup>4</sup> : Dubbing Translation (21:50)
White: ¿Ha estado casado? Black: Casado White: Sí. Black: ( <i>En voz baja</i> ) Lo que faltaba.		Blanco: ¿Ha estado ? casado? Negro: Casado Blanco: Sí. Negro: Amigo.	<ul> <li>Blanco: ¿Ha estado casado? Negro: Casado Blanco: S Negro: O, amigo.</li> </ul>
BT: (in a low voice) What was missing → Just what I needed	BT: Same as Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup>	BT: Friend/buddy	BT: Oh, friend/buddy
TS: Successful idiomatic compensation, phrasal substitution	TS: Same as Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup>	TS: Same as Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup> , with single word substitution for SLT two-word phrase	TS: Same as Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup> ; the tonality and phrasing of the dubbing for Samuel L. Jackson is wonderfully suggestive and effective
	SLT-E (pp	o. 48–49)	
	Black: I come pre	tty close to dyin.	
Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup> : Literary Translation-in- Progress (Bioptic Stage) (pp. 35–36)	Y <sup>2</sup> /S <sup>2</sup> : Literary Translation—Final (Autopsy Stage) (p. 35)	S³: Subtitle Translation (31:13)	S <sup>4</sup> : Dubbing Translation (31:13)
Por poco no lo cuento. BT: I almost didn't tell it [I almost didn't get/live to tell it]	Same as Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup> BT: Same as Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup>	Casi me muero.	Estuve cerca de morir.  BT: I was close to dying

TS: Successful compensation, as slangy as the SLT, although Black's diction is translated away	TS: Same as Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup>	TS: Literal rendition, translates away all flavor of slang	TS: Literal rendition, translates away all flavor of slang
	SLT-E	(p. 53)	
	Black: But I thoug	ht I was in charge.	
Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup> : Literary Translation-in- Progress (Bioptic Stage) (p. 38)	Y <sup>2</sup> /S <sup>2</sup> : Literary Translation—Final (Autopsy Stage) (p. 37)	S³: Subtitle Translation (x:x)	S <sup>4</sup> : Dubbing Translation (x:x)
[P]ero creía tener la sartén por el mango.	Same as Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup>	Omitted (abridged from White's "I see your point" on p. 51 to White's "Why cant you people just accept it" on p. 53)	Same as S <sup>3</sup>
BT: I thought I had the frying pan by the handle.	BT: Same as Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup>	BT: N/A	BT: N/A
TS: Successful compensation, wonderfully slangy in Peninsular Spanish	TS: Same as Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup>	TS: Omission	TS: Omission
	SLT-E	(p. 54)	
	White: Go	od help us.	
Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup> : Literary Translation-in- Progress (Bioptic Stage) (p. 39)	Y <sup>2</sup> /S <sup>2</sup> : Literary Translation—Final (Autopsy Stage) (p. 38)	S³: Subtitle Translation (33:58)	S <sup>4</sup> : Dubbing Translation (33:58)
Santo cielo.	Same as Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup>	Dios nos ayude.	≈ ¡Ay, por Dios!
BT: Holy sky/heaven [Heaven above]	BT: Same as Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup>	BT: God/Lord help us.	BT: Oh, good God/good Lord!
TS: Successful compensation, wonderfully allusive and slangy in Peninsular Spanish	TS: Same as Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup>	TS: Literal rendition	TS: More indirect and informal than S <sup>3</sup> , works better than S <sup>3</sup>

(Continued)

#### SLT-E (p. 59)

Black: You a hard case, Professor.

White: You're not exactly a day at the beach yourself.

Y <sup>2</sup> /S <sup>2</sup> : Literary Translation—Final (Autopsy Stage) (p. 42)	S <sup>3</sup> : Subtitle Translation (38:18) Omitted	S <sup>4</sup> : Dubbing Translation (38:18) Omitted
≈ Es usted duro de pelar, professor. Same as Y¹/S¹	RT- N / A	BT: N/A
one] to  pluck/peel/shell,  professor.	DI.N/A	BI. N/A
Same as Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup>		
TS: Successful compensation, wonderfully slangy in Spanish, even more so than Y1/S1	TS: Omission	TS: Omission
	Translation—Final (Autopsy Stage) (p. 42)  ≈ Es usted duro de pelar, professor. Same as Y¹/S¹  BT: You're hard [a hard one] to pluck/peel/shell, professor.  Same as Y¹/S¹  TS: Successful compensation, wonderfully slangy in Spanish, even more	Translation—Final (Autopsy Stage) (p. 42)  ≈ Es usted duro de pelar, professor. Same as Y¹/S¹  BT: You're hard [a hard one] to pluck/peel/shell, professor.  Same as Y¹/S¹  TS: Successful compensation, wonderfully slangy in Spanish, even more

#### White: I'm not buying it.

Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup> : Literary Translation-in- Progress (Bioptic Stage) (p. 49)	Y <sup>2</sup> /S <sup>2</sup> : Literary Translation—Final (Autopsy Stage) (p. 46)	S³: Subtitle Translation (x:x)	S <sup>4</sup> : Dubbing Translation (x:x)
No me lo trago.	Same as Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup>	Omitted (abridged from Black's "two new things layin there" on p. 66 to White's "Do you believe everything" on p. 66)	Same as S <sup>3</sup>
BT: I'm not swallowing [buyin] it	BT: Same as Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup>	BT: N/A	BT: N/A

TS: Successful	TS: Same as Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup>	TS: Omission	TS: Omission
compensation, as			
slangy in Peninsular			
Spanish as the SLT			

#### **SLT-E (p. 86)**

#### Black: The simplest things has got more to em than you can ever understand.

Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup> : Literary Translation-in-Progress (Bioptic Stage) (p. 64)	Y <sup>2</sup> /S <sup>2</sup> : Literary Translation—Final (Autopsy Stage) (p. 60)	S³: Subtitle Translation (x:x)	S <sup>4</sup> : Dubbing Translation (x:x)
las cosas más sencillas tienen mucha más miga de lo que pensamos	Same as Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup>	Omitted (abridged from White's response of "No" to Black's "Not a member," on p. 86 to Black's "I could eat a bite" on p. 93)	Same as S <sup>3</sup>
BT: The simplest things have more breadcrumbs [substance] than we think	BT: Same as Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup>	BT: N/A	BT: N/A
TS: Wonderfully successful compensation, equally slangy in Peninsular Spanish but with more vivid imagery	TS: Same as Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup>	TS: Omission	TS: Omission

#### SLT-E (p. 88)

#### White: Under your breath.

Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup> : Literary Translation-in-Progress (Bioptic Stage) (p. 66)	Y <sup>2</sup> /S <sup>2</sup> : Literary Translation—Final (Autopsy Stage) (p. 61)	S³: Subtitle Translation (x:x)	S <sup>4</sup> : Dubbing Translation (x:x) Same as S <sup>3</sup>
Por lo bajini.	Same as Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup>	Omitted (abridged from White's response of "No" to Black's "Not a member," on p. 86 to Black's "I could eat a bite" on p. 93)	
BT: Very quietly/ whispered.	BT: Same as Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup>	BT: N/A	BT: N/A

(Continued)

TS: Wonderfully successful compensation, equally	TS: Same as Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup>	TS: Omission	TS: Omission
slangy in Spanish but			
with more vivid			
imagery; tags the			
translation as being into			
Peninsular slang from			
the 1970s and 1980s,			
which corresponds to			
the slang that would be			
used by Black and White			
(who are in their mid- to			
late 50s in The Sunset			
Limited)			

#### SLT-E (p. 108)

Black: You like that? White: It's okay.

Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup> : Literary Translation-in-Progress (Bioptic Stage) (p. 80)	Y <sup>2</sup> /S <sup>2</sup> : Literary Translation—Final (Autopsy Stage) (p. 73)	S³: Subtitle Translation (1:02:33)	S <sup>4</sup> : Dubbing Translation (1:02:33)
¿Le gusta? Regular.	Same as Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup>	Le gusta eso? Está bien.	$\approx$ Le agradece? Same as $S^3$
BT: Do you like it/that? Regular/it's okay/all the same to me.	BT: Same as Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup>	BT: Do you like that?	BT: Does it please you/do you like it?
	It's good/all right/okay	<i>'</i> .	Same as S <sup>3</sup>
TS: Successful compensation, equally slangy in Spanish	TS: Same as Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup>	TS: Explicitation of the SLT slang	TS: Same as S <sup>3</sup>

#### SLT-E (p. 122)

#### Black: Man.

Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup> : Literary Translation-in-Progress (Bioptic Stage) (p. 91)	Y <sup>2</sup> /S <sup>2</sup> : Literary Translation—Final (Autopsy Stage) (p. 82)	S³: Subtitle Translation (1:13:07)	S <sup>4</sup> : Dubbing Translation (1:13:07)
Tío	Same as Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup>	Omitted	Same as S <sup>3</sup>
BT: Man/dude	BT: Same as Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup>	BT: N/A	BT: N/A
TS: Successful compensation, equally slangy in Spanish; tags the translation as being glaringly Peninsular slang (tío for the more generic hombre)	TS: Same as Y <sup>1</sup> /S <sup>1</sup>	TS: Omission. Substitution: Black's facial expression and body language (hangs his head) convey same message	TS: Same as S <sup>3</sup>